



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Kristine Glazer (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Raymond Pohl, Abigail Camp
Associate Commissioners: Vallorie Oliver, Kuhnert, Matt Kuhnert

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, September 22, 2016

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:05 p.m.

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp, Oliver, Kuhnert, Kuhnert
Absent Members: None
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

VI. NEW BUSINESS

1.	Knapp, Beverly	23 Goldfinch Drive	Addition	68-512	JB Studio
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:06)	Oliver – The 15 light door facing the street should be a 9-light. Consensus Agrees. Coombs – The front door is wide. (Existing.)				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the side door to be a 9-light. (Pohl)				
Vote	Carried unanimously b		Certificate #	66613	

2.	Lawrence, Joanne	32 Lily Street	Arbor	42.4.3-40	Self
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Joanne Lawrence , owner – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:08)	Glazer – The location of the arbor has to be exactly delineated on the site plan. Pohl – Don't have an actual design for this arbor; need a photo or drawing of the proposed arbor.				
Motion	Held due to lack of representation by unanimous consent at 1:10 p.m. Motion to re-open at 2:08 p.m. (Pohl) Carried unanimously				
	Motion to Approve through staff with drawings of the arbor to be submitted and painted Nantucket grey. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66618	

3.	Weiler, Eliz	10 Barnabas Lane	House window, deck alts	41-567	Permits Plus
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project: front to remain true-divided light windows (TDL), side & rear to be simulated-divided light windows (SDL).				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:11)	<p>Pohl – The Andersen windows have a flange and the TDL don't; this will call attention to the SDLs. It's not like this is on Fair Street or Orange Street; the area is all circa 1980 in-fill houses. Could approve this on the basis that none of the houses around are truly historic. Asked for a window profile.</p> <p>Glazer – HDC approved the sliding doors in the back, but she is concerned this would set a precedent for SDLs in the old historic district (OHD).</p> <p>Camp – Okay with it.</p> <p>Kuhnert – Share's Ms Glazer's concern.</p> <p>Coombs – She was told the for houses in Town, SDLs don't save as much energy as one would think. Agrees with Ms Glazer and Mr. Pohl. Would prefer an SDL with a traditional-looking muntin.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information. (Pohl)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	
4.	Weiler, Eliz	10 Barnabas Lane	Garage window, door alts	41-567	Permits Plus
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Mark Poor, Permits Plus				
Public	None				
Concerns	No comments at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track. (Pohl)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	

VII. VIEWS					
1.	Wade Cottages Nom. Trust	37 Shell Street	Solar panels	73.1.3-5.5	Self
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	<p>Wade Green – Presented project; no place on the ground for them.</p> <p>Suzanne Green – Panels to be black on a black roof and sit 5 inches off the roof. The garage is circa 1930s. A new house blocks visibility of this array from Broadway. Putting a panel on the little shed would make it asymmetrical.</p>				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:19)	<p>Glazer – The garage is tucked back; the only viewing potential is from the Bluff Walk. This is largely not visible. Each panel is 39.5X36 inches.</p> <p>Coombs – The panels will be difficult to see as long as they are black.</p> <p>Kuhnert – Agrees.</p> <p>Camp – The neighbors will be looking at them; wants to ensure they are black and cover the whole roof. We need a drawing showing exactly where the panels will be placed.</p> <p>McLaughlin – He believes it is visible from Broadway. He thinks there is enough land to put them on the ground.</p> <p>Pohl – He's okay with the lack of visibility.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees about the black on black. Asked if the array closest to the street could be put on the smaller roof.</p> <p>Glazer – Read SAB comments: Said not visible and recommend a site view.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the noted specs for size and to be all black due to limited visibility through staff with a photo of the actual panel. (Pohl)				
	Motion to re-open to hear SAB comments. (Pohl) Carried unanimously Carried unanimously				
	Mr. Pohl's original motion stands.				
Vote	Carried 3-1//McLaughlin opposed Camp abstain			Certificate # 66614	

2. Island Realty Assoc	12 Pine Street	Chng to clapboard	42.3.2-57	David Wiley
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:35)	Glazer – We had asked for historical data. No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Pohl)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
3. Pin Oaks Properties	28 West Chester Street	Addition & window changes	42.4.3-53	Thornewill Design
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project; believes it is not visible. House circa 1980s			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:36)	Glazer – There is limited visibility. Kuhnert – Read HSAB comments: no concerns if not visible; no historic information. Coombs – Building goes sideline to sideline. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66615	
4. Pin Oaks Properties	28 West Chester Street	New garage	42.4.3-53	Thornewill Design
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project; it is visible from Wesco Place.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:41)	Kuhnert – Read HSAB comments: overall okay but a little too vertical. Pohl – Agrees with HSAB. Discussion about a dropped roof design.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Pohl)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
5. Creech, Darcy	21 Quidnet Road	Barn	21-30	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:45)	Oliver – This is a modest sized building; would like to view it with a height pole. Shouldn't have white trim due to all the decks. Pohl – There are an awful lot of 2 nd -floor decks for a building this size. McLaughlin – The 2 nd -floor decks are 48 feet over the requisite 30%.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and View with height poles. (Pohl)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

6.	Creech, Darcy	21 Quidnet Road	Roof walk skirt	21-30	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow – Presented project; roof is cedar natural to weather.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:52)	Pohl – This isn't visible from the street.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as natural to weather due to lack of visibility. (Pohl)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66616	
7.	Reinke, Michael	1 Davis Lane	New house	82-70	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow				
Public	Matthew Tomaiolo – No vegetation on the lot; the lower wrap-around deck is consistent with the neighborhood.				
Concerns (1:54)	Brain Swain , for 5 Heller Rd – Had submitted a letter of concerns: height, deck, reconfigure for density buffer.				
	Oliver – The massing is not in keeping with the neighborhood; this is a large box with no additive massing and too many 2 nd -floor decks. The porch is in keeping with the neighborhood.				
	Pohl – As designed, this is inappropriate for Nantucket; it's a tall box with a low roof pitch on a very wide structure. Agrees about the 2 nd -floor decks.				
	McLaughlin – The 2 nd -floor decks exceed the 30% of the outside area; needs to come down to 46 feet. Agrees with what's been said.				
	Glazer – Agrees with what's been said.				
	Camp – Agrees with what's been said. North elevation, the dormers are out of scale.				
	Kuhnert – Agrees with what's been said.				
	Coombs – Agrees with what's been said. The front door sidelights need to have a bottom panel.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
8.	Farekzad, Omid	39 Sankaty Road	New studio	49.2.3-51	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:03)	Glazer – Noted that the plantings are not in the ground; they are still in the balls.				
	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66617	
	Back to 32 Lily Street				
9.	Hudzik, Brian	7 Parker Lane	Garage	67-319	Self
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Brian Hudzik , owner – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:13)	Camp – Would like to see the three gabled windows ganged.				
	No other commissioner agrees with that.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66619	

10. Coburn, Holly	21 Nanahumacke Lane	Garage	57-28	Milton Rowland
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Ben Normand , Rowland and Associates – Presented project; trim is white and garage doors white.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:16)	Discussion about color of garage doors. McLaughlin – East elevation, the four garage doors are a lot for such a short wall.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with only three doors on the north elevation. (Pohl)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66620
11. Mackler, Frederick	9 North Point	New garage	38-80	Paul Jensen
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:22)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Pohl)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
12. Kalman, Michelle	42 Mary Ann Drive	New garage	68-964	Niko Petkov
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Ben Normand , Rowland and Associates – Presented project; the 8-over-8 windows take up more wall space than 6-over-6.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:22)	Coombs – The 8-over-8 windows are a little too wide at 3.5X4.8. Front door should have a simple trim. Camp – If the windows were six inches taller, that would alleviate the horizontal look. Kuhnert – Agrees with Ms Coombs. The Nr 1 window should be less vertical. McLaughlin – No comments. Pohl – This is almost 30 feet tall. Agrees about the windows. Oliver – This feels more three story than two story but fits with much that is in the area.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66621
13. C.N.C Realty Trust	48 West Chester Street	New dwelling (Lot 1)	41-385	Milton Rowland
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Ben Normand , Rowland and Associates – Presented project; thinks there is context for a two-story house.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:31)	Kuhnert – Read HSAB comments: Georgian design not appropriate for this area. Pohl – This will tower over the stucco house right next to it and is close to the road; agrees it's design is not appropriate for the neighborhood. The neighboring two-story house is set well back off the road as well as the stucco being farther from the road. McLaughlin – Agrees with Mr. Pohl. Oliver – The width of the façade on the street is too much; should be simpler and pushed back from the street. Glazer – This is more appropriate for the other side of Liberty Street. Should look at other structures in the immediate area for a better design that is more fitting to this neighborhood.			
Motion	Motion to View and hold for revisions. (Pohl)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

14. Surf ACK, LLC	1 Hatikva Way	Tertiary dwelling	67-343,193	Val Oliver
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Kuhnert			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Val Oliver , Val Oliver Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:40)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried Unanimously	Certificate #	66622	
15. Surf ACK, LLC	3 Hatikva Way	Tertiary dwelling	67-343,193	Val Oliver
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Kuhnert			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Val Oliver , Val Oliver Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:40)	No concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried Unanimously	Certificate #	66623	
16. Newquist, Aileen	29 Main Street (Sconset)	Roof chng 3 tab to arch	73.3.1-9	T&T Roofing
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Kuhnert			
Alternates	Oliver			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:45)	Glazer – Read SAB comments: architectural shingles needs to be revisited; not appropriate. Camp – Architectural shingles anywhere on Main Street ‘Sconset is not appropriate.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
17. Wood, Florence	67 Tom Nevers Road	Garage	76-52	Twig Perkins
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Alyssa Corry, Twig			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:47)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66624	
18. Norris, Mark	130 Main Street	Demolition	42.3.3-96.3	Self
19. Norris, Mark	130 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3-96.3	Self
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:48)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

20. Dunn, Lee	137 Orange Street	Demo main house	55-286	Arthur Reade Jr.
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing Public	Arthur Reade , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP – Presented project; circa 1900s.			
Concerns (2:49)	<p>Coombs – Recalls the board decided engineering reports are to be independent from independent engineers and not one in the employ of the applicant. We have allowed three houses in the vicinity of Orange Street to be demolished based upon the applicant’s engineer report. Stated the tree in the yard is protected.</p> <p>Kuhnert – The assessor’s survey identifies construction date as late 1800s. Asked if the board wants another assessment of the condition of all three buildings.</p> <p>Camp – Suggested that Mr. Kuhnert research the history of this house as well as all structures.</p> <p>Oliver – Asked why this was never brought up for Demolition by Neglect. This area is part of the rezoning that allows structures to be 40 feet in height.</p> <p>Pohl – Haven’t had an HDC staff to keep up with Demolitions by Neglect.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This structure has the true dimensions of a saltbox but the inside is gone; it would need a lot of repair and should be demolished.</p> <p>Glazer – Would like an independent review. Will need a request for legal services to pursue Demo by Neglect.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
21. Dunn, Lee	137 Orange Street	Demo shed	55-286	Arthur Reade Jr.
22. Fee, Henry	141 Orange Street	Demo dwelling	55-153	Arthur Reade Jr.
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing Public	Arthur Reade , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP – Presented project.			
Concerns (2:49)	See Item 20			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
23. Nantucket 62 Walsh St.	62 Walsh Street	Garage	29-85	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Kuhnert			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing Public	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Concerns (3:05)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66625	
24. EK Assoc. LLC	5 Finback Lane (Lot 3)	New dwelling	66-509	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing Public	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.			
Concerns (3:10)	<p>Glazer – Would like the eave dropped a little.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Noted a drafting error.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the eave coming down 6” and with revised drawings. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66626	

VIII. HDC BUSINESS

Approve Minutes	None
Review Minutes	None
Other Business	<p>*** This item was unanticipated by the chairman 48 hours in advance*** HDC sign-off for temporary Certificate of Occupancy (CO) for Cyrus Peirce Middle School addition COA# 63697</p>
Voting	Glazer, Coombs, McLaughlin, Pohl, Camp
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert
Recused	None
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.
Representing	Diane O'Neil, NPS Facilities Manager Steven Gribben , SMRT Architects – Exterior is mostly complete and meets code. Looking for sign off with contingencies. Still working on the eave soffit trim then the gutters and downspouts put on; two doors are not the permanent doors and could be done in about two to three weeks. The Building Department is providing 60 days.
Public	None
Concerns (3:17)	No concerns.
Motion	Motion to Provide a 60-day signoff for a temporary CO. (Camp)
Vote	Carried unanimously
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

Motion to Adjourn: 3:22 p.m.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Nantucket Old Historic District

Scotset Advisory Board District

Madaket Advisory Board District