



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Kristine Glazer, Abigail Camp
Associate Commissioners: Vallorie Oliver, Matt Kuhnert

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, November 3, 2016

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:00 p.m.

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Catherine Flynn, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer
Absent Members: Camp, Oliver, Kuhnert
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: McLaughlin, 2:56 p.m.

Agenda adopted as amended by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

Glazer – Corrected rumors of her resignation from HDC, “I did not resign from the HDC.”

II. NEW BUSINESS

1.	Grovelane Realty Trust	24 Grove Lane	Rev. 64215: bracket & chimney	41-439	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:02)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66856	

2.	East Eden LLC	82A Baxter Road	Deck, windows, chimney	49-38	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project; structure circa 1980s right addition added later.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:05)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66857	

Minutes for November 3, 2016, adopted Nov. 15

3.	Lindsay, Ron – 66858	15 Pippen’s Way	Color chng house	43-94.3	Self
4.	Lindsay, Ron – 66859	15 Pippen’s Way	Color chng guest house	43-94.3	Self
5.	Lindsay, Ron – 66860	15 Pippen’s Way	Color chng garage	43-94.3	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Ron Lindsay – Presented project: platinum grey to white. Submitted context photos of two neighboring houses with white trim and sashes. Asked for black or another color for the sashes.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:08)	<p>Glazer – It was a fastidious process to approve these structures; there is a lot of fenestration on the house which the applicant assured would be mitigated by using grey. She wonders when the board will adhere to its own decisions in regards to larger houses in the context of their own setting; white trim doesn’t do that. Would be okay with another color for the sashes but not all white.</p> <p>Coombs – There are 29 windows and doors on the west elevation alone.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No concerns with the sashes being another color.</p> <p>Pohl – The houses that have white trim are simple; this is a large and formal two-story house with a complicated roof plan. He believes the condition of grey was the HDC’s way of allowing a structure of this size and scale in this neighborhood.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve all three through staff with platinum grey trim but sashes and doors to be black. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66858 to 66860	
6.	Osgood, Ward	43 Tennessee Avenue	Rev. 65418: windows & massing	59.4-310	Rowland & Assocs
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Mickey Rowland , Rowland and Associates – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:17)	<p>Pohl – Read MAB comments: second-floor deck should remain as approved.</p> <p>Glazer – Prefers the prior approval but okay with this.</p> <p>No concerns</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66861	
7.	Boardman, William	150 Main Street	Rev. 65382: shed	41-156	Rowland & Assocs
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Mickey Rowland , Rowland and Associates – Presented project; corrected the extending overhang since HSAB review; presented revised drawings at the table.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:27)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: rake overhangs too large.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff without the rake overhang, per Exhibit A. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66862	
8.	Boardman, William	150 Main Street	Hardscape: fencing	41-516	Julie Jordin
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Julie Jordin , Garden Design – Presented project; clarified plans.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:29)	<p>Pohl – Read HSAB comments.</p> <p>Glazer – West elevation, the fence should correspond to the east side 42” fence.</p> <p>Discussion of running a 5&1 fence along the rear only with a 5’ board fence down the west side.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west fence reduced to 5’ board fence from the end of the rubbish bin to the back of the stoop; the rest to be 5&1; gates to be 3’WX42”H and to be straight across the top; use antique granite on the east elevation window well; 48” fence around the A/C; all to be natural to weather per Exhibit A. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66863	

9.	Hajjar, Michael	2 South Pasture Road	Second-floor addition	80-297.2	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:45)	Glazer – Overall it’s an improvement. North elevation, the shed dormers have too much shingled walls; shorten the walls 6” both sides and separate the windows a bit. Coombs – South elevation, the French door should have a kick panel or something to protect kids from the glass panes. McLaughlin – The exterior stairs should hug the wall. Pohl – Andersen doesn’t make French doors with kick panels; Marvin has that. Prefers the exterior stairs as drawn.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north and south elevation dormers brought in 6” on both side and the windows separated one shingle width. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66864	
10.	Surf Ack, LLC	2 Hatikva	Fence changes	67-343	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:00)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the east side 6-foot natural to weather board fence being kept and the fence perpendicular to Surfside Road being eliminated. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66865	
11.	Wepler, John	8 Fair Street	Rev. 66394: elim adtn/chg wnds	42.3.1-107	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project: HSAB addressed drafting errors.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:04)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments. Discussion about drafting errors noted by HSAB.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the steps corrected per HSAB comments. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66866	
12.	Abbott, James	6 Chester Street	Rev. 66720: stoop railing	42.4.3-65	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:10)	Pohl – This proposal would remove the historic rail on the side. Read HSAB comments: not in favor of change. No one supports changing the historic railing on the side.				
Motion	WITHDRAWN				
Vote	N/A		Certificate #		

13. Cappel, Jeff	19 Gardner Road	Porch infill	43-172	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project; noted a drawing error. Eric Dori , Woodmeister – This property is on the unpaved portion of Gardner Road.			
Public	None			
Concerns	Glazer – This goes from five to eleven windows facing Gardner. Coombs – She would like to view it from Gardner Road to check visibility. McLaughlin – The proposed fenestration exceeds the 50% of the wall space policy.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
14. Sturges, Christina	13 Boulevard	Rev. 65370: roof ptch & wells	80-126	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:25)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66867	
15. Robisol, Micahael	15 Meader Street	New door	42.2.3-45	Stuart F.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Stuart Flegg			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:29)	McLaughlin – The front door should be a standard six-panel especially in the old historic district. Glazer – The existing door is good looking. Coombs – Suggested a batten door as a storm door with a glass interior door. Pohl – One option is a six-panel door with the top panels glass. Discussion about a batten door with four or six lights.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the east elevation door a six light at the top and a batten inset panel. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66868	

VIII. VIEWS

Motion to Hold the following for the beginning of November 10, 2016 meeting. (Glazer) Carried unanimously (2:38)

1. Quidnet Develop.	26 Quidnet Path Road	Garage	21-150	Andrew Falkenstein
2. Vournas, Mary	10 Aurora Way	Garage	56-443	Permits Plus
3. Landman, Michael	20 Quidnet Road	Shed	21-117.1	Self
4. 9 North Road Realty Trst	9 North Road	Rev. 63377, re-site garage	43-131.1	Sophie Metz
5. 9 North Road Realty Trst	9 North Road	Rev. 64569, driveway	43-131.1	Sophie Metz
6. Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	New dwelling	63-55	Paul Guitard
7. O'Toole, John	4 Plainfield Road	Garage/cottage	73.4.1-1	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:41)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	66869	

8.	Winter, Duncan	26 Monohansett Road	Second dwelling	79-145	Rob Anderson
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Rob Anderson – Presented project. Presented aerial photo of the property and photo of the existing at the table.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:44)	<p>Pohl – Read letter of concerns from Sharon Jacobson, abutter. Her concerns are not germane to HDC’s purview. This is cottage situated directly behind the main house.</p> <p>Glazer – The 2-over-2 windows don’t work with this design. West elevation, the windows in the shed are haphazard. East elevation, the second-floor windows should be ungangled.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Agrees with Ms Glazer. The curved deck should be squared off. South elevation, the front door should be a six-panel door. The meeting rails need to be aligned. Suggested a view.</p> <p>Coombs – All the ganged windows should be separate; there’s plenty of wall space to do that. Thinks it might be visible coming around the corner onto Monohansett. Agrees with Mr. McLaughlin about viewing.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View with height poles. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
9.	BJ’s Constellation	5 Heather Lane	Hardscape: pool	30-24.1	Julie Jordin
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Julie Jordin , Garden Design – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:56)	Glazer – The pool equipment should be screened by a natural to weather board fence.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with location of pool equipment specified and screened by a natural-to-weather board fence. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66870	
10.	Hertz, Dorothy	1 Friendship Lane	Garage	66-247	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Dorothy Hertz – Presented project; would like to increase the roof; garage doors to short and want to eliminate the lights; wants to use cedar vertical board on the dormer sidewalls to match the house.				
Public	None				
Concerns (3:02)	Pohl – Raising the roof and eave 1 foot would allow the meeting rails to align. Cutting the corners would bring the trim down to the windows. The dormers need to be pulled off the ridge about a foot.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
11.	Marshall, Meredith	141 Main Street	Hardscape: move pool	41-172	Waterscapes
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Associated site and elevation plans, photos, correspondence, and historical documentation as required.				
Representing	Jessie Dutra , Waterscape – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (3:09)	Glazer – The dimensions on the plans don’t match the dimensions on the application. Pool equipment needs to be screened by a natural-to-weather board fence.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the pool dimensions updated to 16X42 and equipment surrounded by natural-to-weather board fence. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	66871	
Motion to Hold following items for the beginning of the November 10, 2016 meeting. (Glazer) Carried unanimously (3:12)					
12.	106 Surfside LLC	106 Surfside Road	New dwelling	67-80	Emeritus
13.	Schuerell, James	28 Flintlock Road	Hardscape: pool, fence, gate	75-79	Topham Design
16.	ACK Last LLC	7 Judith Chase Lane	Renovation	42.3.2-62	Dwyer Maloney

XI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	None
Review Minutes	None
HDC Business (2:53)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion of preparation of and timeline for HDC meeting minutes. Held. • Review of and possible vote on resumé and application for HSAB position. Motion to Appoint Brook Meerbergen to the HSAB position vacated by David Barham. (McLaughlin) Carried unanimously • Vote and approve upcoming schedule change, cancelation of 11/8/2016 meeting due to National Election. Motion to Approve this schedule change. (Coombs) Carried unanimously
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

Motion to Adjourn: 3:14 p.m.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Nantucket Old Historic District

Sconset Advisory Board District

Madaket Advisory Board District