



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Kristine Glazer, Abigail Camp
Associate Commissioners: Vallorie Oliver, Matt Kuhnert

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, January 17, 2017

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 4:30 p.m.

Called to order at 4:31 p.m.

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Cathy Flynn, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
 Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver
 Absent Members: Camp, Kuhnert
 Late Arrivals: None
 Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. OLD BUSINESS

<u>Owner's Name</u>	<u>Address of Proposed Work</u>	<u>Scope of Work</u>	<u>Map / Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	New dwelling	63-55	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and 3D model.			
Representing	Nick Winton , Anmahian Winton Architects – Reviewed project. Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Mazen Saker , Anmahian Winton Architects – The chimney is not that visible. Mark Poor, Permits Plus Lesley Riedel, owner			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:34)	McLaughlin – Appreciates the low height and changes made. Coombs – The window changes help. She would prefer the chimney to corbel; it seems too large for two flues. The panes on the 6-over-6 windows are too square; the vertical shape is correct on the French doors. The single pane windows on the connectors could be a problem due to sun reflection. The main house looks like one building that has been pulled apart. Oliver – The simplicity of the individual masses is fine; however the overall composition has all pieces of the same size with fascia lines at the same level; she would prefer more additive masses. There is no hierarchy to the main mass; it looks commercial. Glazer – The model helps. Agrees the main house needs additive massing. Could accept the location of the front door but not all the buildings being the same size. Pohl – The view from the public way is a concern because secondary structures are blocking the main house. He likes the simplicity. The chimney as designed should be pargetted to match the architectural simplicity.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

2.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	Guest house	63-55	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and 3D model.				
Representing	Nick Winton, Anmahian Winton Architects Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Mark Poor, Permits Plus Lesley Riedel, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:08)	Discussion about the overall composition. Pohl – This little structure has very little to be concerned about.				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track the main house. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	
3.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	Pool house	63-55	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and 3D model.				
Representing	Nick Winton, Anmahian Winton Architects Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Mark Poor, Permits Plus Lesley Riedel, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:17)	McLaughlin – The 6-light windows should be hoppers or fixed. This fits with the main house as designed. Coombs – The windows and French doors should match the main house. Oliver – It’s a simple structure but bears too much weight in respect to the others; it should be a lot less in regards to mass. Glazer – She agrees with Ms Oliver; we are having difficulty with the hierarchy of the buildings. The casement windows at the 2 nd -floor are what is seen when approaching the house from the road and they add to the verticality of the structure. Pohl – This is now the <i>de facto</i> entrance with very small, high placed casement windows; it need to be more inviting. Changing the direction of the gable might help.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	
4.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	Garage	63-55	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and 3D model.				
Representing	Nick Winton, Anmahian Winton Architects Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Mark Poor, Permits Plus Lesley Riedel, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:30)	Coombs – This is narrower on the eave side than on the gable end; that doesn’t work. Oliver – Agrees with Ms Coombs. A porch on something might help the overall statement. Glazer – Nothing to add. McLaughlin – The gable end does not meet the 1.5:1 width:height ratio.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	

5.	Theodorakos, Vaios	81 Pocomo Road	Guest house move on	15-3	CWA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Photos and site plan.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Chip Webster Associates – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:39)	Clarification of the move on location. McLaughlin – Asked to review the move off before the move on. There are no compass points. No comments. Coombs – No concerns with moving this off the promontory; but it is going in front of the house here but it is well off the road with a lot of brush to screen it. She would prefer it moved a little more east and in. No other concerns. Pohl – Recalling the main house discussion, there was a motion to move on that carried 2-1; the motion to reopen was made by someone not in the majority and Town Counsel has ruled that the vote to reopen was invalid resulting in the main house move on being approved. That project is assigned COA 67108A.				
Motion	Motion to Approve the move on. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin opposed		Certificate #	67271	
6.	Engle, Kristen	Trust 90 Pocomo Road	Guest house move off	15-43	CWA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp				
Alternates	Oliver				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Photos and site plan.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Chip Webster Associates – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:39)	No comments.				
Motion	Motion to Approve the move off. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin opposed		Certificate #	67272	
7.	Tack 3 LLC	26 Washington Street	Rev. 62137: raise & renovate	42.3.2-23	CWA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos,				
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Chip Webster Associates – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:55)	Coombs – This part of Washington Street is one of the oldest developed portions with small houses; this proposal is not in keeping with that. The east elevation is over fenestrated and almost everything is ganged. The south elevation also has too many ganged windows and is visible from Washington Street. This has two porches and little to no additive massing; the wing should be dropped lower than the original main mass. West elevation, the 3-bay is almost as wide as the main mass. McLaughlin – Clarification on a typographical error. Glazer – The west elevation ell should come down in height. Okay with the changes made in fenestration. Pohl – The 3-bay facing Washington Street is better than the 4-bay; agrees with Ms Coombs about breaking up some of the ganged windows. Agrees with Ms Glazer about reducing height of the ell on the west elevation.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for minor revisions. (Glazer)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
8.	Hanley Development	4 Pilgrim Court	Hardscape: pool	41-217	Edgewater
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Glazer				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence.				
Representing	Paul Cronin – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:12)	Staff – Read previous concerns from Dec. 8, 2016. Coombs – We don't usually allow caps on walls; the caps should come off the sitting wall. Would like the south west corner of the fence to turn into the corner of the pool house and not go around the property corner. No one else has concerns about the fence or hot tub cap.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the bluestone cap removed from the sitting wall. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	67273	

9. K225 LLC	3 Brewster Road	Rev. 64894: fence	54-261	Chip Stahl
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Chip Stahl – He is willing to place vertical board over the outside of the horizontal boards.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:23)	Oliver – She viewed this and the south side is very visible as well as being painted white; it looks like a wall. If the north fence remains, it should not be white McLaughlin – He agrees; the whole thing should be replaced with a typical picket fence. Coombs – Agrees with Mr. McLaughlin. Pohl – Suggested a way to keep the posts but have them covered by pickets.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with removal of the horizontal boards and adding 1X3, natural-to-weather pickets on the front face to cover the large posts. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67274	

10. Willse, David	33 New ‘Sconset Street	New dwelling	73.4.2-83	Topham Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and correspondence..			
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Reviewed the application. He will move the structure forward and lower it about six inches to address abutter concerns. This property will actually address Sunset Ridge Lane; they will be filing to make its address 1 Sunset Ridge Lane.			
Public	Joe Guay , for abutters at 3 Sunset Ridge Lane – If the applicant comes in with a foundation plan, with window wells, that shows this being moved off the property line four feet and the ridge height lowered, that will address his client’s concerns.			
Concerns (6:32)	Pohl – Read email from Mr. Guay about client’s concerns: ask that it be moved off the north property line. Oliver – The massing is simple. West elevation, the 1 st -floor “B” windows should relate more to the 2 nd -floor windows. McLaughlin – There is a 7-foot grade change from the road to the top of the rise. South elevation, the awning windows are not appropriate; should be hoppers or fixed. Coombs – Thinks he’s done much of what has been requested. Agrees with Mr. Pohl about the west elevation porch and windows. Pohl – Suggested moving the west elevation “B” window under the porch to align with the “A” window above it and the porch pulled in to give the “A” window more space.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation “B” window closest to the front door to be aligned under the “A” window and the porch to move in 1.5 feet toward the window, the 2nd- “B” window to become an “A”; the building to shift 4 feet south following the grade; and the “E” awning windows to be hoppers. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67275	

11. Scheurell, James	28 Flintlock Road	Addition, porch, and dormer	75-79	Topham Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence.			
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Presented project. Passed out revised plans at the table.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:52)	Oliver – Likes the dormer and the porch; the piece being added to the south and north sides have an eave line higher than the main house. Coombs – Agrees with Ms Oliver. Would like a proper front door on the south elevation; it needs more presence. McLaughlin – North elevation left side, the window should be a hopper or fixed. Glazer – Agrees with Ms Oliver and Ms Coombs. Pohl – The addition’s ridge and eave heights can go lower if the gable gets wider.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

Break 7:05 to 7:10 p.m.

12. Wegner, Judith	50&50R Quidnet Road	New studio/garage	21-90	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:11)	Oliver – This is a vast improvement. No concerns. McLaughlin – The 6-light windows should be hoppers or fixed. Pohl – The garage doors should be all board.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the garage doors to be vertical batten doors and the awning windows to be fixed. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67276	
13. Perlman, Andrew	2 Dartmouth Lane	Cabana	41-115.2	Thornewill Design
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:18)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67277	
14. Perlman, Andrew	2 Dartmouth Lane	Hardscape: pool	41-115.2	Amy Manning
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:23)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
15. Six Gull Island R.T.	6 Gull Island Lane	Addition & historic renovation	42.4.3-61	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic report, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project; reviewed ages of masses.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:24)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: need ages of additions and a window survey; early windows should be refinished. Reviewed letters of support and a letter of concerns. Glazer – Would like the age of each addition added to the plans. The quirkiness of the building is now being eliminated. The south elevation has minimal visibility. Would like as many existing windows reused as possible. Coombs – Agrees with HSAB, we need a window survey. Would like a demolition plan. Would prefer the 1935 chimney to remain. Oliver – Agrees with what’s been said.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information and detail. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

16. Six Gull Island R.T.	6 Gull Island Lane	Garage/cottage renovation	42.4.3-61	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	none			
Concerns (7:48)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: maintain clapboard; add a rolling barn door on north elevation; side door should be a 6-light; west elevation, check muntin pattern. Consensus would like the age of the structure and maintain the clapboard.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
17. Wendin Nom. Trust	1 West Chester Street	Hardscape: shower, steps	42.4.3-15.2	Dave Champoux
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Dave Champoux – Reviewed changes to increase screening of interior elements.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:53)	Oliver – This is very open with a straight visible line from the road to the shower. Discussion about the proposed fill which will require a retaining wall. McLaughlin – A lot of this will be visible. Glazer – Asked for an alternate location for the shower or for the hedge opening to break up the sight line. Suggested ensuring the shower head is below the top of the shower enclosure, then it will look like a tall fence. Coombs – Would prefer the vegetated screening is evergreen, not privet.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the shower head not to show above the natural to weather shower enclosure and evergreen planting between the shower enclosure and street. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67278	
18. McCann, Tom	35 Hummock Pond Road	Porch, deck, roof	56-6	Self
19. Betsey, Michael	11+15 Sankaty Road	Garage revs, door, pergola	73.1.4-47	Andrew Berman
20. Miner, Timothy	12 South Valley Road	Cottage revs, brckts, window	43-139	Main St. Construct
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Hold 18, 19, & 20 for representation. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
21. Neimitz, Peter	138 Miacomet Road	Remove dormer, window chng	81-6.3	Self
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Peter Neimitz			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:04)	Oliver – She viewed this and has no concerns due to minimal visibility. McLaughlin – The dormer is not appropriate to the aesthetics of the house.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67279	

22. Keating, Barbara	46 Starbuck Road	Renew COA 54295: house	60-31	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Val Oliver – Asked this be held for revisions per MAB review			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:07)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
23. Dugan, Tim	14 Sandpiper Way	New dwelling	76-85	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project; south elevation is not visible. Tim Dugan.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:08)	McLaughlin – No comments. He likes it. Coombs – No concerns. Glazer – North elevation, the 2 nd -floor windows right are very small. Asked if the 2 nd -floor of the south elevation is visible from Tom Nevers Road. Pohl – Would like the north elevation right 2 nd -floor windows to be the same size as the ones below.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation three 2nd-floor right windows to be the same size as the triple-ganged windows below. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67280	
24. Lombardi, Mark	2 Winn Street	New dwelling	41-183	Self
25. Lombardi, Mark	2 Winn Street	Pool house	41-183	Self
26. Lombardi, Mark	2 Winn Street	Hardscape: pool	41-183	Self
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:18)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
27. Cowan, Cameron	48 West Miacomet Avenue	Re-site structure on lot	86-4	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:21)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as indicated. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67281	
28. Cowan, Cameron	48 West Miacomet Avenue	Move off	86-4	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:24)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	67282	

29. Cowan, Cameron 49 West Miacomet Avenue Move on 86-3 Botticelli & Pohl
 Voting Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver
 Alternates None
 Recused Pohl
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans and photos.
 Representing **Lisa Botticelli**, Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.
 Public None
 Concerns (8:26) No concerns.
 Motion **Motion to Approve. (Glazer)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate # 67283**

III. OTHER BUSINESS

Approve Minutes	January 5, 2017: Motion to Approve. (Glazer) Carried unanimously
Review Minutes	January 10, 2017
Other Business	Discussion on Board of Selectmen memo dated March 4, 2015 regarding professional staffing at HDC meetings: McLaughlin – This letter when it was sent started problems; as yet a professional is in an administrative position. We are the only commission without a professional at the meeting. He hates seeing that this is still going on. The commission votes on who their administrator is and he would like a motion to make Mr. Hedden the administrator. He wants that vote on the next agenda. Pohl – The good news is Mr. Hedden is now 100% dedicated to the HDC. Glazer – Mr. McLaughlin is correct about HDC voting on who is their representative.
Commission Comments	1. Glazer – Asked for a copy of Mr. Pohl’s letter that went to the BOS at their January 11, 2017 meeting. It can’t be discussed at this meeting but perhaps at a future meeting. 2. Hedden – Asked for Organizational Meeting agenda items be sent to him by Friday January 27, 2017.

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Board of Selectmen memo dated March 4, 2015

Motion to Adjourn: 8:35 p.m.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

Sign Advisory Committee