



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Kristine Glazer, Abigail Camp
Associate Commissioners: Vallorie Oliver, Matt Kuhnert

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, February 7, 2017

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 4:30 p.m.

Called to order at 4:32 p.m.

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Cathy Flynn, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp
Absent Members: Glazer, Oliver, Kuhnert
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	McAvoy, Sean – 67339	24 Sankaty Head Road	Rev. 65284: chimney	48-1.7	Emeritus
2.	McAvoy, Sean – 67340	24 Sankaty Head Road	Rev. 65285: chimney	48-1.7	Emeritus
3.	Houlihan, James – 67341	28 Swift Rock Road	Add 2 nd floor deck	40-43	Val Oliver
4.	106 Surfside LLC – 67342	106 Surfside Road (West lot)	Change window to door	67-80	Emeritus
5.	Drake Partners LLC – 67343	21 Ahab Drive	Window revisions	82-97	Val Oliver
6.	Duncan, Richard – 67344	15 Golf View Drive	Basement stairs	66-171	NAG
7.	Roberts, Christopher – 67345	13 Milestone Crossing	Shed	68-456	Structures Unlimited
8.	Dalury, Alexandra – 67346	125 Polpis Road	Shed #1	68-646	Thornewill Design
9.	Dalury, Alexandra – 67347	125 Polpis Road	Shed #2	68-646	Thornewill Design

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried 3-0//McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # 67339 to 67347

III. NEW BUSINESS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Theriault, Mike	71 Goldfinch Drive	Revise stoop, frieze	68-569	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Mike Theriault – There is no topsoil or landscaping in place; there is fill and topsoil coming as well as plantings that will screen the foundation.			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:34)	<p>Pohl – This is the result of a failed inspection report; read the failed inspection report. The approved drawing shows a three-step stoop; the photo shows five steps.</p> <p>Coombs – The stoop goes to the ground, so there can't be fill put in. The south elevation frieze is 5/4 X5 in the approval; it's wider in the photo; there is no single course of clapboard between the windows and frieze as shown in the drawings; suggested a trim board across above the windows to separate them from the frieze. In regards to the white trim around the windows, without the seam lines, the window framing looks different.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Expressed frustration about the work being done without a permit. Reminded the owner it is his responsibility to ensure the work is done according to the approval.</p> <p>Camp – Pargetting the foundation would eliminate the seams, which make the foundation look like granite.</p> <p>Pohl – Pargetting the foundation, paint out the vent, and run a course of trim between the frieze board and windows.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a parget coat on the foundation, the vent painted to match the clapboard, and a 1 3/4 X 3/4 trim board between the frieze board and windows. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67348	

IV. OLD BUSINESS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Carrolo, Joseph	5 Old Farm Road	New Dwelling	55-921	Sophie Metz
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Sophie Metz – Presented project. Explained how the rear yard might be landscaped. Patty Carrolo Joseph Carrolo			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:53)	<p>Coombs – The program goes from lot line to lot line front to back and side to side; there will be very little green space left. This is an area where there is usually a fair amount of green space. The design is good; however, the north elevation dormer windows don't align over the windows below. Would like more green space along the sides so it doesn't look so crammed in. The window wells on the front a fairly large.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with Ms Coombs about filling the lot. West elevation, could use more fenestration especially on the gable forward. The gable forward on the front looks like it was stuck on and pinched.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Appreciates the height and design. The "E" and "D" awning windows should be fixed or hoppers.</p> <p>Pohl – It's an attractive house on a difficult site. His concern is what is happening at the back where the lot behind is very much lower. Noted the large house to the right also goes from side setback to side setback.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #		
2. McCann, Tom	35 Hummock Pond Road	Porch, deck, roof	56-6	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	Pohl & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Mark Lombardi			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:15)	<p>Pohl – Reviewed the application.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The added gable roof pitch is 6/12.</p> <p>Pohl – The existing house has a 6/12 pitch roof</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67349	

Minutes for February 7, 2017, adopted Feb. 21

3.	Lombardi, Mark	2 Winn Street	New Dwelling	41-183	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp				
Mullen-Rule in	Pohl & Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.				
Representing	Mark Lombardi – This rear basement exit can't be seen because of the undulation of the cemetery and the cabana. Reviewed the changes made per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:19)	Camp – No concerns. Coombs – He fixed the windows. There's not much can be done to the front. McLaughlin – No comments.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	67350	
4.	Lombardi, Mark	2 Winn Street	Pool house	41-183	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp				
Mullen-Rule in	Pohl & Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.				
Representing	Mark Lombardi – Brought the dormer side walls in. It has one upstairs bedroom. Pool equipment is under the main building porch.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:27)	McLaughlin – Needs a proper 6-panel front door. After discussion he's okay with the structure as drawn since the front wouldn't be visible. Camp – It looks like a second dwelling, not a pool house. No concerns about no front door. Coombs – East elevation, the three small windows under the larger 2 nd -floor windows. No concerns about no front door. Pohl – Suggested that on the south elevation, the 1 st floor window could be turned into a front door and the basement window under eliminated.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	67351	
5.	Lombardi, Mark	2 Winn Street	Pool	41-183	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp				
Mullen-Rule in	Pohl & Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.				
Representing	Mark Lombardi – Reviewed changes made. He would prefer the driveway to be all brick. Explained the drainage system and the fencing. Feels it will be nearly impossible to see into the back yard even in the winter.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:32)	Camp – Not sure about material for the driveway. There is so much in the way of hard materials on this lot; she would like vegetation to soften the pool house and the hardscaping. Clarification and discussion of the landscaping: fencing, fire pit, gas fire, stepping stone, etc. McLaughlin – There is no gate in the fence; there should be one right of the bluestone deck at the bottom of the steps. The Quaker Cemetery is considered a publicly travelled way. Pohl – The abutting property is already built with all the same elements in almost the same position. It is a good benchmark for the visibility. He agrees with Mr. Lombardi that most of the landscaping will be masked.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with enhanced vegetation on the east elevation of the pool house and a gate at the bottom of the ell-shaped stairs. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	67352	

Minutes for February 7, 2017, adopted Feb. 21

6.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	New Dwelling	63-55	Permits Plus
	Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
	Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
	Recused	None			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
	Representing	Nick Winton , Anmahian Winton Architects – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Leslie Riedel Mark Poor , Permits Plus – We addressed all the concerns of the commission and went beyond that.			
	Public	None			
	Concerns (5:48)	Pohl – Asked for comments on the overall compound first then details of each building. Camp – Globally it’s interesting, sensitive, and well proportioned. Coombs – Agrees, the rearrangement of the building structures has improved it. Architectural element comments: McLaughlin – All of this is visible from publicly travelled ways. It bothers him that the front door is a double door. Camp – She is okay with the front door and the chimney due to the minimalist design of the structure. Coombs – It’s an interesting house and has no concerns about the front door. Appreciates the changes made.			
	Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the front door to be a single, vertical-board door. (Coombs)			
	Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67353	
7.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	New Guest House	63-55	Permits Plus
	Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
	Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
	Recused	None			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
	Representing	Nick Winton , Anmahian Winton Architects – There are no awning windows, just hoppers on this structure. Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Leslie Riedel Mark Poor			
	Public	None			
	Concerns (6:10)	No concerns as long as the awning windows are hoppers.			
	Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with all the awning windows to be hoppers. (Coombs)			
	Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67354	
8.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	New Pool House	63-55	Permits Plus
	Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
	Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
	Recused	None			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
	Representing	Nick Winton , Anmahian Winton Architects – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Leslie Riedel Mark Poor			
	Public	None			
	Concerns (6:17)	No concerns.			
	Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
	Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67355	
9.	Friend, Scott	15 Head of Plains	New Garage	63-55	Permits Plus
	Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
	Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
	Recused	None			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
	Representing	Nick Winton , Anmahian Winton Architects – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Mazen Saker, Anmahian Winton Architects Leslie Riedel Mark Poor			
	Public	None			
	Concerns (6:20)	Pohl – All the other buildings feel more grounded; if the gable were two feet wider, the structure wouldn’t feel so vertical. Consensus agrees.			
	Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the building widened by two feet. (Coombs)			
	Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67356	

Minutes for February 7, 2017, adopted Feb. 21

10. Perlman	2 Dartmouth Lane	Hardscape: revise pool	41-115-2	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	Pohl & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:29)	Discussion clarifying the grade and retaining walls and pool fencing.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67357	
11. Rugged Scott, LLC	8 Thistle Road	Gazebo	67-841	Cottage & Castle
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	McLaughlin & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Jamie Feeley , Cottage & Castle – Explained the project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:41)	Coombs – The brackets should be eliminated; the area is very simple, so this should be simple too. Camp – The octagon shape is a little ornate for the area; agrees no brackets. McLaughlin – No cupola. Pohl – Agrees about the brackets. Okay with the shape.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the cupola and brackets eliminated. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67358	
12. TACK 3, LLC	26 Washington Street	Rev. 62137: raise/renovate	42.3.2-23	CWA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Chip Webster , Chip Webster Associates – Reviewed the changes made per previous concerns. Ethan Griffin, Chip Webster Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:50)	Coombs – She has expressed her concerns and is opposed this proposal. No other commissioners have concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-0//Coombs abstain	Certificate #	67359	
13. Watts, Michael	6 Goose Cove Way	Front door change	59.4-366	JB Studio
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Door is Essex green.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:56)	Coombs – The front door is not in keeping with the design of the structure, which calls for more substantial front door trim. Camp – Would prefer the door be natural to weather. Agrees with Ms Coombs about more trim. McLaughlin – The front door should be a standard 6-panel door with two lights.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the front door to be natural to weather mahogany with no plugs and wider trim. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-1//McLaughlin	Certificate #	67360	

14. Sanford, Terry	1 Jefferson Lane	New Dwelling	55.4.1-74.1	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	McLaughlin & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented the project; white trim and white clapboard. The window wells on Jefferson Lane are being eliminated.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:08)	<p>Camp – The color pallet should reflect the other structure with Essex Green. East elevation, the “D” windows are very small; they should be “Bs”. North elevation, the roof plain should have only one skylight. Would like the door to be Essex green to go with the existing building. She would be okay with a tall chimney as this is a Victorian design.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This will be highly visible. North elevation, only one skylight per roof. West elevation, 2nd-floor meeting rails need to align; same on the east elevation 2nd-floor, right.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees about adjusting the 2nd-floor dormer windows and only one skylight per roof plain.</p> <p>Pohl – The main ridge is too tall. South elevation, the two gable dormers facing Jefferson are very close together; separating them would simplify that side. The chimney doesn’t meet code in terms of its height; if it were to meet code, it would be objectionable and is too close to the dormer.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
15. Fogarty, Brian	40 Jefferson Avenue Lot 12	Move/demo dwelling	30-119	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	McLaughlin & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed project; original structure circa 1920.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:26)	<p>Pohl – Because this is a dwelling, it has to be advertised for 30 days as a move before they can demolish it.</p> <p>No concerns because the many additions have left very little original shape and fabric.</p>			
Motion	<p>Motion to Approve as a move or demolition. (Coombs) Carried unanimously</p> <p>Motion to reopen. (Coombs) Carried unanimously</p> <p>Motion to Approve as a move or demolition due to the later additions, which have eliminated the shape of the original structure. (Coombs)</p>			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	67361
16. Fogarty, Brian	40 Jefferson Avenue Lot 12	Move/demo garage	30-119	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	McLaughlin & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:31)	No concerns provided the garage doors are saved.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move or demolition due to the compromised structure and the applicant’s willingness to save the garage doors. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	67362
17. Fogarty, Brian	(NB) 40 Jefferson Avenue Lot 12	Move/demo shed	30-119	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:35)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move or demolition. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	67363

Break 7:37 to 7:42 p.m.

Minutes for February 7, 2017, adopted Feb. 21

18. Scheurell, James	28 Flintlock	Addition, porch, dormer	75-79	Topham Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:43)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67364	
19. Field, Rachel	77 Somerset Road	New Dwelling	66-84.1	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	McLaughlin & Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Rachel Field – Reviewed changes made pre previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:47)	<p>Camp – Southwest elevation, the second-floor “D” double-hung windows in the kitchen are very small; suggested they be a little wider so they aren’t so narrow.</p> <p>Coombs – Northwest elevation, the windows are floating in the wall space; suggested adding a third set of windows in the middle; this is in the back with limited visibility.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Pohl – The northwest elevation is not visible. The kitchen windows should be one-stock size wider.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the southwest elevation, kitchen windows to be one-stock-size wider. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67365	
20. Zaloom, George	3 Mulberry Street	Addition	42.3.2-31	Concept Design
21. Darling Hyman Trust	30 Quidnet Path	Garage revisions	21-149	Brook Meerbergen
22. Darling Hyman Trust	30 Quidnet Path	New Dwelling	21-149	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:38)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #		
23. S/P Norwell, LLC	78 Union Street Lot1	Rev. Main House	55.1.4-72	BPC
24. S/P Norwell, LLC	78 Union Street Lot 2	Dwelling revisions	55.1.4-72	BPC
25. S/P Norwell, LLC	78 Union Street Lot 3	Rev. Cottage relocation	55.1.4-72	BPC
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #		

26. 23 Broad Street, LLC	23 Broad Street	Awning	42.4.2-77	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, advisory board comments, and awning color sample.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:59)	<p>Pohl – Explained that green and blue awnings become too hot; the applicant is asking for beige; the same color that was approved across the street for Dune.</p> <p>Staff – Read HSAB comments: need samples, appreciate solid color choices.</p> <p>Camp – The color should be darker; “Avena” is good.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Agrees with using “Avena”; it’s more appropriate.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with Camp and McLaughlin.</p> <p>Pohl – The board agrees the need for a darker color “Avena - 6678”.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information from the applicant. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #		

27. 23 Broad Street, LLC	23 Broad Street	Arbor	42.4.2-77	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp			
Mullen-Rule in	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:05)	<p>Pohl – Reviewed the project and the previous concerns. They submitted an arbor similar to the one at Corner Table. No concerns with the flat arbor.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	67366	

V. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	January 17, 2017: Motion to Approve. (Camp) Carried 4-0 January 24, 2017: Motion to Approve. (Camp) Carried 4-0
Review Minutes	January 26 & 31, 2017
Other Business	None
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents, not available on the website or in the files, used at the meeting:

1. None

Motion to Adjourn: 8:13 p.m.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

Sign Advisory Committee