



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Kristine Glazer, Abigail Camp
Associate Commissioners: Vallorie Oliver, Matt Kuhnert, Stephen Welch

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, February 23, 2017

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:06 p.m.

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, PLUS Administrative Specialist; Cathy Flynn, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp, Oliver, Kuhnert, Welch

Absent Members: None

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. OLD BUSINESS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Gillis, Rich	2 Camelia Lane	Rev. 67098	55-367.1	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Kuhnert, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:07)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	67476	
2. Hanson, Laura	55 Centre Street	Rev. 66306: new fndtn	42.4.3-72	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver – The front is not going to be lifted; asking to dismantle the rear addition then put in the foundation and re-use as much original material as possible in the rebuild with the new addition. Matthew Kuhnert , consultant to client – The main mass is circa 1790; the two rear additions were in place by 1833. This addition had significant changes between 1904 and 1909.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:13)	Discussion about the reuse of original material from the existing rear ell. Glazer – In light of the fact of the changes made, she feels the applicant is being very conscientious; no concerns with lifting the rear ell. Asked for documentation on the number of existing windows and doors in the rear ell. Camp – She has no concerns about the proposed new rear foundation but is sorry to see the new second-story addition. Coombs – Would like to see a chimney on the new rear ell. McLaughlin – Confirmed there is no exterior access to the new cellar.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with submission of an inventory of windows and doors and reuse of the door with transoms. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	67477	

3. 6 Gull Island	6 Gull Island Lane	Additions	42.4.3-61	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Reviewed the project and changes made per previous concerns and additional requested information.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:27)	<p>Glazer – South elevation, some of it will be visible and the new addition ridge is longer than the main mass ridge.</p> <p>Coombs – What is proposed is interesting; she would like to see the west elevation fireplace and chimney saved. The windows in the existing rear portion could be repaired and reused.</p> <p>McLaughlin – There are five 6-lights window with no description. (Those are existing and staying.)</p> <p>Oliver – Doesn't think the south elevation will be visible. She would like the cantilevered bumpout stay larger. East elevation, would like a second window added to the right wall.</p> <p>Kuhnert – Appreciates that the intervention is kept to the area most recently altered.</p> <p>Camp – East elevation, agrees with Ms Oliver about a larger bumpout and adding a window.</p> <p>Pohl – East elevation, the single story ridge running parallel to the main mass is atypical; suggested an alternate way of handling that.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	
4. 6 Gull Island	6 Gull Island Lane	Cottage	42.4.3-61	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Asked this track without comment.			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
5. Falcon Park, LLC	20 Gosnold Road	New Dwelling	30-86	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting), McLaughlin, Glazer, Oliver, Kuhnert			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:51)	<p>Kuhnert – Appreciates the changes. His concerns have been addressed.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with Mr. Kuhnert.</p> <p>Glazer – North elevation, the second-floor railing on the right should be shortened to match the left. The 12” columns seem slightly too large.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	67478

6. Sherrill, Dave	6 Pippens Way	Cabana	43-94.5	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Kuhnert			
Alternates	Oliver, Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Bill McGuire , Nantucket Architectural Group, LTD – Presented revised plans at the table. Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:59)	<p>Camp – No concerns.</p> <p>Kuhnert – Proportion should be 1/3 enclosed to 2/3 open; but if it's not visible, he has no concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – On the east and west elevations, she would like another post.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees about the visual aspect but he firmly believes that the visibility would make it hard to notice the depth and length of the open space.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	67479	
7. Roby, Kathy	9 Broadway	Pergola, stairs	73.1.3-72	SMRD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert, Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:05)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		
8. Darling Hyman Trust	30 Quidnet Path	Garage	21-149	B. Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Glazer, Oliver, Kuhnert			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:06)	<p>Glazer – She would like the cupola eliminated and the dormers reduced to a single row of windows.</p> <p>Kuhnert – The cupola is not appropriate.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with what's been said. The main house is very simple and this is complicated.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees. On the second floor, the space is uninhabited; suggested reducing to one story with no dormers.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees about removing the cupola. Agrees with Ms Glazer about the transoms; suggested a single row of larger windows using the Nr 4 window pane size.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		
9. Darling Hyman Trust	30 Quidnet Path	New second dwelling	21-149	B. Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Glazer, Oliver, Kuhnert			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Reviewed context photos. The location is restricted by a Massachusetts Endangered Species Act building envelope.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:16)	<p>Discussion about the 22-foot height restriction on second dwellings versus the distance of this from the main house.</p> <p>Coombs – Southeast and northwest elevations, the fenestration should be simpler.</p> <p>Oliver – No concerns due to the color palette. This doesn't relate to the main house which is 200 feet away.</p> <p>Kuhnert – The height is a concern; we should abide by the 22-foot rule.</p> <p>Glazer – This structure has no additive massing; it's a box. Due to its proximity to the road, it should be lower. Agrees with Ms Coombs about the fenestration. The garage doors shouldn't have transoms.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees about simplifying the southeast elevation. The subordinate ridge should be not so long.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		

10. Nantucket Land Bank	48 Tennessee Avenue	Building move off	59.4-92	Dane DeCarlo
Voting	Coombs (acting), Camp Kuhnert, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Dane DeCarlo – Reviewed the project; he couldn’t find the previous approval for a move to the Madaket Admiralty Club; reviewed minutes from a Land Bank meeting discussing moving it to the Madaket Admiralty Club. The north elevation barn doors are no longer accessible and he had previously asked to move the doors to the south elevation with windows on the north; that would change the integrity of the building. It’s proximity to the street blocks the road every time the doors open.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:30)	Coombs – Read MAB comments: prefer remain in current location. Camp – She would prefer it remain and be restored. She would like to see where it would be on the other lot. Kuhnert – Agrees with MAB; this is a contributing building in the State and Federal Historic District; moving it off its parcel has an impact on its historical integrity. He opposes the move without evidence of a previous approval. If the Land Bank doesn’t want to be bothered with maintaining a historic resource, it should not purchase properties with historic resources on them. Welch – There is a story path of moving structures around the island and this would be in the same area and put to good use. He supports the move. Coombs – She’s against the move because part of a historic building’s importance is its location. She believes it can be properly restored in its current location. The applicant has the choice of a denial or withdrawing.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	
11. Nantucket Land Bank	23 Tennessee Avenue	Building move on	60.1.2-57	Dane DeCarlo
Voting	Coombs (acting), Camp Kuhnert, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Dane DeCarlo			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	
12. Delay, Michael	14 Cherry Street	Demolition	55-380	Self
13. Delay, Michael	14 Cherry Street	New dwelling	55-380	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert, Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Glazer)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	
14. Frates, Jim	10 North Water Street	Roofing, chimney work	42.4.2-97	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Glazer, Camp			
Alternates	Oliver, Kuhnert, Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, photos, brick sample, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:50)	Kuhnert – Read HSAB comments: not appropriate to remove the chimneys but okay with rehabilitation/reconstruction. Coombs, Glazer, Camp, & Pohl – Agrees with HSAB McLaughlin – No comments.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the rebuild of both chimneys and grey, 3-tab roofing material. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	67480

