



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Abigail Camp (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Diane Coombs, OliverVallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, January 6, 2022

This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube.

Called to order at 1:00 pm. and announcements by Ms. Camp

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Esmeralda Martinez; PLUS Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill
Absent Members: Pohl, Welch, Dutra
Late Arrivals: McLaughlin, 1:17 pm
Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

Backus – We no longer not have an HDC Compliance Coordinator for the Town

II. DISCUSSION OF PRE-STAINED WHITE CEDAR SHINGLES

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill

Concerns Held for a full board

III. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Eileen Harkness 12-5286	5 Gardner Perry Lane	Rev. 07-4216: color change	55/32.1	Thornewill Design
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Thornewill			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5286

IV. DENIAL

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Charles Schwarzapfel 10-2033	9 Main Avenue	Pool	60.3.1/425	NAG
• Denial due to lack of response				
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Deny for lack of response. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-10-2033

V. NEW BUSINESS 12/07/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Rose R.T. 11-5107 (OB)	28 India Street	Spa	42.3.4/8	Jardins Int.
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:07)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
2.	Jim & Karen Poole 11-5232	43 Main Street	Fence	73/18	Brent Young
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Brent Young Val Oliver				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:09)	Young – Presented project. He had suggested they do a wire fence between a double row of hedge. Backus – SAB did not look at this. This is just outside the old historic district (OHD) in ‘Sconset; it will be seen especially in the winter. Oliver – Mr. Young’s pictures of the hedge were taken in November. Thornewill – This type is fence, 5&1, isn’t found in ‘Sconset; it should be natural to weather and of a type found in ‘Sconset. Suggested 40” Type II picket. She’d be okay with double privet and embedded wire. Coombs – Agrees that a 6’ fence is inappropriate on Main Street in ‘Sconset. Privet doesn’t give protection in the winter. This should be a picket fence natural to weather behind the hedge. She’s okay with the wire in privet. Camp – She could approve a different type of fence. Double privet with wire is a different story.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a double privet hedge with wire between as shown on the landscape plan and screening maintained in perpetuity. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-11-5232
3.	Anthony Noto 11-5270	10 Lincoln Avenue	Addition & renovation	30/184	Emeritus
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:17)	Backus – Mr. MacEachern has asked his projects be held for a full board.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, January 11th. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
4.	450 Green Park LLC 11-5272	2 Stone Alley	Adtn/Alter/foundation	42.3.1/102	Emeritus
Voting	Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:10)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, January 11th. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0// Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	

VI. OLD BUSINESS 12/14/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	23 Broad St, LLC	23 Broad Street	Fenestration & addition	42.4.2/77	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch, Dutra				
Recused					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public					
Concerns (5:14)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, January 11th. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0// Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	

VII. NEW BUSINESS 12/21/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Andrew Sievers 12-5305	12 Codfish Park	New shed	73.2.4/9	Salt Spray Sheds
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Andrew Sievers, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:15)	<p>Sievers – Presented project; the main house was put in place in 2006.</p> <p>Backus – The main house is circa 1906. Read SAB comments: height should come down; concerned about number of horizontal battens and strap hinges. She agrees with SAB.</p> <p>Oliver – Where this is tucked in, it will be relatively unseen. The concern isn't the height but proportions. If the roof pitch goes to 9/12, that would bring the height down sufficiently.</p> <p>Coombs – It should come down; dropping the pitch would work. Agrees with SAB about the door strap hinges.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Agrees with dropping the roof pitch. The plans describe double 15-light doors, which are inappropriate.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the roof pitch changed to 9/12 to bring the height down and the simple doors as recommended by SAB. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5305
2.	3 Beaver St, LLC 12-5316	3A Beaver Street	Dormers, raise foundation	55.1.4/97	Polly Walldorf
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates					
Recused					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Polly Walldorf				
Public					
Concerns (1:33)	Martinez – Is request to be held for Tues				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, January 11. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried //McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-12-5316

3.	Jim & Cindy Henrich 12-5354	37 Fair Street	Roof & fenest. changes	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:34)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1820 Typical Nantucket individually significant. Addition was approved in August 2021. HSAB hasn't had a chance to look at this, and they should. HDC approved the natural-to-weather roof walk, now they are asking for the skirt to be white. Basement access should blend in with the new deck. Concerned about removal of the basement doors, in lieu of windows, on the south elevation; the doors are a typical treatment. The basement access is most appropriate on the rear; doesn't understand if the second access on the north. North elevation, a window is missing one of its shutters. West elevation, is missing a set of shutters. South elevation should remain as previously approved. Mr. Rowland said the side basement access is inappropriate; the roof walk skirt should not be painted; fenestration change to double ganged on the north elevation is inappropriate.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The west elevation is visible from Darling Street.</p> <p>Coombs – Asked why the building is being raised (new foundation); should go back to the same height. Agrees this should go to HSAB. North elevation, position of the shutters is haphazard; prefer the single window; the triple ganged windows should remain as approved.</p> <p>Oliver – The south rear stairway should be tucked against the building; if it stays sticking out, it should be screened. North elevation cellar stairs are atypical; it should be better integrated.</p> <p>Thornewill – The roof walk half skirt shouldn't be painted. North elevation double ganged windows don't read correctly.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with what's been said. This should go to HSAB.</p> <p>Motion to Hold revisions and for HSAB review. (Coombs)</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold revisions and for HSAB review. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye				Certificate #

4.	John Manera	4 Larrabee Lane	New dwelling	55/102.7	Linda Williams
5.	Koyote Realty Trust	4 Hickory Meadow Lane	Roof walk	41/900	Linda Williams
6.	8 North Star NT	8 North Star	Roof walk	30/212	Linda Williams
7.	Sam Shamoun	9 Field Avenue	New dwelling	80/162.1	Linda Williams
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:40)	<p>Backus – Ms. Williams requested her projects be held for Tuesday.</p> <p>Oliver – These were not in the packet for pre-review.</p> <p>Not opened.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold Ms. Williams projects for Tuesday, January 11th and links made available for commissioner review. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill, Camp, and Oliver-aye				Certificate #

VIII. OLD BUSINESS 12/28/2021

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	13 Commercial Wf., LLC 09-4749	13 Commercial Wharf	Revise changes on addition	42.2.4/10	NAG
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Bill McGuire, Nantucket Architectural Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:56)	<p>McGuire – asked to hold for full board.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, January 11th. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye				Certificate #

Proposed HDC Minutes for January 6, 2022

2. Robert Meyer **10-4866** 307 Polpis Road New Dwelling 25/39 CWA
 3. Nice to Be Back, LLC **11-5037** 43 Kendrick Street New pool 76.4.3/31 CWA

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing David Bartsch
 Public None

Concerns (6:32) **Bartsch** – Asked Mr. Webster’s project be held.

Motion **Motion to Hold at applicant’s request. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Camp, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

4. Kim Wentworth **11-5168** 14 Lincoln Avenue Move & increase pool 30/182 Mark Cutone
 5. NIR Retail LLC **11-5041** 4 Harbor Square Renovate building 42.2.4/1 Workshop APD
 6. 22 Easton LLC **05-3644** 22 Easton Street Pool & hardscape 42.1.1/12 Ahern Design
 7. Okay Okay House **10-4821** 10 Union Street Parking & patio 42.3.1/43 BPC Architecture
 8. Family Ties Ack, LLC **11-5125** 11 Alliance Lane Pool, court, hardscape 39/24.1 Atlantic Landscaping
 9. Family Ties Ack, LLC **11-5159** 11 Alliance Lane New dwelling 39/24.1 Studio Ppark
 10. 33 North Mill St., LLC **11-5126** 7 North Mill Street Hardscape 55.4.4/77 Atlantic Landscaping

Voting Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None

Concerns (2:02) Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold Items 4-11 for Tuesday January 11th. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0// McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

11. Brett Fodiman **10-4969** 27 Cato Lane Main House 55/118 CWA

Voting Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates
 Public None

Concerns (2:03) **Webster** – Presented project.

Oliver – Appreciates some of the massing changes, especially on the east; however, the eave lines are still all the same, doesn’t look additive. North elevation, the wing massing is atypical; the details should help it look more additive.

Thornewill – Agrees with Ms. Oliver. The front door is on the secondary mass when it should be on the 4-bay section; the secondary mass eave should drop. The drop to 1.5 stories as proposed isn’t enough.

McLaughlin – No comments.

Coombs – It should have some 1-story massing; with the eaves all the same, it’s essentially 2-story. The front door should be in the 4-bay mass. There’s plenty of room the telescope down to 1 story.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Oliver, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

12. Brett Fodiman **10-4968** 27 Cato Lane Guest House 55/118 CWA

Voting Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates
 Public None

Concerns (2:12) **Webster** – Presented project; height is 25’

McLaughlin – The meeting rails don’t align; they should be raised on the west and east elevations. Need to show railings around the basement and access.

Thornewill – Reads very flat. The front needs some relief. East elevation, asked how the basement is accessed and if the well will have a railing. There should be some change in the fenestration because it reads almost too simple.

Oliver – Agrees with Ms. Thornewill. The site plan shows no retaining or steps to the basement. South and north windows are off enough to be add. West elevation, the front door needs more presences. 25’ is overly tall.

Coombs – Almost all windows are ganged. It looks like a hotel. The front door needs more presence. The height should come down to 22’; this looks like a Monopoly house. West elevation, the right side needs a window.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

13. Brett Fodiman 10-4970	27 Cato Lane	Garage	55/118	CWA
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Chip Webster, Chip Webster Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:20)	Webster – He'll carry over feedback onto this garage.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main house. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #

IX. NEW BUSINESS 01/04/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Faith Breen 11-5147	19 Broadway Sias	Roof change	73.1.3/111	Steven Stockigt
Voting	Camp, McLaughlin, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:23)	Backus – The January 4 applicants are scheduled for advisory review next Monday. This is going from 3 tab to architectural. This is Willow Harp circa 1760. The application doesn't indicate the roofing material. Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information and SAB review. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
2.	Duane Jones 12-5360	21 Meader Street	Fence	42.2.3/44	Val Oliver
3.	Brett Fodiman 12-5374	3 Tetawkimo Drive	New dwelling	53/41	CWA
4.	John Wolff 12-5385	32 Woodbine Road	New 2 nd dwelling	80/18	MCA
5.	Georgi Dimov 12-5383	15B Greglen Avenue	New shed	68/187.1	Georgi Dimov
6.	Grace Hull 12-5397	27 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/380	Topham Design
7.	Terrence Carden 12-5378	7 Mayhew Drive	Alterations	92.4/209	Permit Plus
8.	Christian Brunet 12-5377	4 Quidnet Road	M.H. alterations	20/709	Permit Plus
9.	Christian Brunet 12-5376	4 Quidnet Road	Cottage alterations	20/709	Permit Plus
10.	Galley West LLC 12-5396	1 Mothball Avenue	Move on studio	83/424	Sophie Metz
11.	Paul Darrah 12-5393	28 N Water Street	Dormer fenst chng	42.4.3/22	EMDA
12.	Peter Lisi 12-5407	2 Flintlock Road	Rev. 05-1012: drmr & wndw	75/50	Shelter 7
13.	Barbara VonDerGorben 12-5388	132 Main Street	Hardscape	42.3.3/45	Grady Murtagh
14.	Brad Henke 12-5409	14 Oak Hollow Lane	Roof top solar	56/114	Cotuit Solar
15.	John Barry 12-5398	22 Eel Point Road	Demo or move off garage	40/45	Emeritus
16.	Don Russell 12-5422	14 Brewster Road	New 3 rd dwelling	54/236	Don Russell
17.	LBC Sconset LLC 12-5413	9 Hawks Circle	Hardscape revision	74/37.1	Ahern LLC
18.	Pat Augustine 12-5419	13 Woodbury Lane	Hardscape revision	41/549	Ahern LLC
19.	Eric Savetsky 12-5418	12B Oak Hollow	Pool & hardscape	56/128.2	Ahern LLC
20.	4170 & Down LLC 12-5416	107 Tom Nevers Road	Hardscape	91/26	Ahern LLC
21.	Johnson Charles Trust 12-5415	24 Bassett Road	Driveway & hardscape	26/61	Ahern LLC
22.	1 Caroline Way LLC 12-5414	1 Caroline Way	Pool & hardscape	82/59	Ahern LLC
23.	Tallat LLC 12-5423	14 Union Street	Addition & fenestration	42.3.2/17	Meerbergen Designs
24.	Tallat LLC 12-5424	14 Union Street	New shed	42.3.2/17	Meerbergen Designs
25.	Olsen Family 12-5425	28 Prospect Street	New dwelling	55.44/77.1	Val Oliver
26.	66 Easton, LLC 12-5417	66 Easton Street	Fence	42.4.1/62	Toni Yacobin
27.	Hightide Partners 12-5446	8 Ackermuck Way lot 29	Hardscape	41/618	Atlantic Landscaping
28.	Elizabeth Powell 12-5445	71 Cliff Road	Hardscape & retaining wall	30/160	Atlantic Landscaping
29.	Elizabeth Powell 12-5440	71 Cliff Road	New cabana	30/160	Thornewill Design
30.	Melissa Spruce 12-5433	21 Bank Street	Rev 72714: addition	73.1.3/57	Gryphon Architects
31.	Georgi Dimov 12-5434	3 Miles Court	Addition	68/187.2	Georgi Dimov
32.	NIR Retail LLCV 12-5442	27 Old South Wharf	Widen dormer	42.2.4/2	Emeritus
33.	Eleven Lincoln Trust 12-5444	32 Jefferson Avenue	Move/demo studio	30/132	Botticelli + Pohl
34.	Eleven Lincoln Trust 12-5447	32 Jefferson Avenue	Move/demo guest house	30/132	Botticelli + Pohl
35.	Eleven Lincoln Trust 12-5443	32 Jefferson Avenue	New guest house	30/132	Botticelli + Pohl
36.	1 Caroline Way, LLC 12-5439	1 Caroline Way	Main house revisions	82/59	Vicente Burin
37.	Ali & Zach Smit	232 Madaket Road	New dwelling	59.4/120.1	JN Design

Proposed HDC Minutes for January 6, 2022

38. Ali & Zach Smit	232 Madaket Road	New dwelling	59.4/120.1	JN Design
39. Michael Robinson	13 Fayette Street	Roof walk	42.3.2/28	Sanne Payne
40. Courtney Arnot	8 New Street	Fence	55.4.1/35	Courtney Arnot
41. Delfmark, LP	10 Rugged Road	Move off	67/303	Stephen Maury
42. Larry Maury	23 Washington Street	Like-kind window replace	42.3.1/39	Larry Maury

X. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	December 21, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, January 11, 2022 at 5:00 pm. ZOOM • Discussion of Advisory Board Review • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves
Commission Comments	

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:26 pm. (McLaughlin)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornevill, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Camp-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board

