



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday January 12, 2023

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 1:02 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill

Remote Participants: Coombs

Absent Members: Dutra, Patten

Late Arrivals: Coombs, 1:22 pm

Early Departures: Pohl, 1:52 pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted (Welch)**

Vote Carried unanimously

I. COMMISSION COMMENTS

1. Welch – As chair of the Organizational Focus Committee creating solar guidelines, he will respond to questions with the I&M regarding solar.
2. Welch – The Organizational Focus Committee will meet next week to discuss the topic of advisory board and the article for Town Meeting. It will be noticed also as an HDC meeting so anyone can attend.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

1. None

III. OLD BUSINESS 11/15/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Eloise NT 10-7303	1 Sandy Drive	Skirt, windows, doors	29/73	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Thornewill			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:10)	<p>Thornewill – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Backus – Elevation letter was submitted. Height overall 30'9". Welch – His only concern is the perception of the piers; they appear as though architecturally the furthers corners are holding up the structure; suggested replacing lattice fascia either side of the stairs with piers. Camp – Likes that idea; should break the lattice in half up with piers. Pohl – Agrees the expanse of lattice should be broken up. North elevation, divide the left expanse in half with a pier. Suggested the piers have a brick veneer.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the addition of 1 pier on north elevation left mass, adding 4 piers to the east elevation lattice, and adding 4 piers on the south elevation lattice. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7303	

IV. NEW BUSINESS 11/17/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Sankaty, LLC 01-7626	49 Sankaty Road	Hardscape	49/66	Dustin Maury
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:22)	Backus – Applicant asked this be held. Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No action at this time.			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #
2. David Pfund 11-7428	24 Union Street	Renovation	42.3.2/177	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Thornewill			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:23)	Thornewill – Presented project. Backus – Circa 1754. Need information if there will be a full replacement of the windows and doors. The window survey needs pictures of the interior of windows. Agrees transoms are not appropriate. There will be visibility of the side from Main Street at some point so the light configuration will be visible. Read advisory comments: South facing French doors will be visible from Union Street; transoms are not appropriate over French doors. Oliver – Confirmed which windows are being replaced. No concerns. Camp – Nix the transom. Separate the 2 nd -floor double-hungs on the north elevation to align with 1 st -floor triple-ganged outside windows. North elevation, the small 1 st -floor window should be the same size as the one to the right. Welch – North elevation, agrees with Ms. Camp. South elevation, not so concerned about transom with smaller lights in the. Pohl – Nix the transoms. He likes the concept of 2 windows in the kitchen rather than 3 on the south.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with elimination of the south elevation transoms and 2 windows in place of the triple ganged to align with second floor. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0			Certificate # HDC2022-11-7428
3. 41 Hulbert, LLC 11-7516	41 Hulbert Avenue	MH massing/fenestration	29/18	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:33)	Pohl – Asked this be held for Tuesday			
Motion	No action at this time.			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #
4. John Bartlett 11-7515	19 Bartlett Farm Road	Solar roof array	65/16.1	ACK Smart
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.			
Representing	Tobias Glidden, ACK Smart			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:33)	Glidden – Presented project. Welch – It meets our solar guidelines sufficiently to be appropriate based upon being set well back from the street and a low pitch roof on a 1-story structure. Camp – No concerns. Oliver – Wishes there were some screening. Coombs – There will be vegetation in the future; she'd approve this with that.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to roof color, roof pitch, and distance from the street. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Coombs, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye; Oliver-nay,			Certificate # HDC2022-11-7515

5.	Jerry Michaud	11-7514	58 Walsh Street	Solar roof array	29/97	ACK Smart
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, advisory comments, and manufacturer spec sheet.					
Representing	Tobias Glidden, ACK Smart					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:40)	<p>Glidden – Presented project; wood roof.</p> <p>Backus – Wood is atypical for solar. Agrees with advisory group comments.</p> <p>Read advisory comments: This should be viewed to see if the east wing panels will be visible from Walsh Street. Limit (thickness of the) top of panel to 4" above roof plane.</p> <p>Oliver – Visibility of the panel on the dormer will be minimal due to the shallow pitch.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees.</p> <p>Camp – To bad it's on a wood roof but it's okay.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve due to limited visibility. (Welch)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2022-11-7514
6.	Tamora Wing	11-6510	52 West Chester Street	New guest house	41/381	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver					
Alternates	Thornewill					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:44)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; existing shed will be moved to the right.</p> <p>Backus – Main house is 1850 Greek revival; proposed should relate architecturally to existing.</p> <p>Read advisory comments: The main house is very simple with a rather shallow roof pitch. The proposed cottage would relate better if the roof pitch weren't quite as steep.</p> <p>Camp – Likes the idea of widening it to eliminate the "rocket ship."</p> <p>Oliver – The pitch should relate more to the main house.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees. North elevation, the 1st-floor triple-ganged windows should be reduced to 2 separated.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees. Lower roof pitch and decrease the interior ceiling height to bring height down and relate better to the main house. The 7' doors throw off the perception of the proportions.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees with what's been said.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and for a view. (Oliver)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	
7.	Waterfalls Enterprises, LLC	11-7513	7 Union Street	LK siding & window	42.3.1/146	Emeritus
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	None					
Representing	None					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:52)	<p>MacEachern – Asked this be held for more information.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>					
Motion	No action					
Roll-call Vote	N/A				Certificate #	
8.	Prickley Pear	01-7625	17 Broadway	Rev. storage bin	73.1.3/112	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	Oliver					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Val Oliver, V. Oliver Design					
Public	None					
Concerns (time)	Not opened at this time.					
Motion	No action					
Roll-call Vote	N/A				Certificate #	

9. 7 Starbuck Ct, LLC 01-7663	7 Starbuck Court	Rev. 01-2818: MH color	42.3.3/80	Todd Burnes
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:53)	Backus – We need more information. Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No action			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #

10. Hannah Gardner Hse, LLC 11-7499	6 Gull Island Lane	Rev. fenestration	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:55)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No action			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #

V. OLD BUSINESS 11/29/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Fair City, LLC 08-6886	115 Old South Road	New building	68/112	EMDA
2. Fair City, LLC 08-6887	115 Old South Road	New building	68/112	EMDA
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:55)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	No action			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #
3. 39 Monomoy Rd, LLC 08-6851	39 Monomoy Road	Addition, reno. & move	54/79	Emeritus
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:55)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – The saltbox portion is a character defining feature though it is relatively new. The addition isn't subordinate to the main structure; need to know exactly what of the original structure is being retained.</p> <p>Oliver – This is a good job.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees; however, the additive massing should be more subordinate and telescope down and away. East elevation of additive massing is very mundane.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates the proposal. Agrees with Ms. Camp about telescoping down.</p> <p>Thornewill – This is a grand house in spirit. The earlier addition wasn't respectful; this addition is better.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with what's been said. West elevation, they should replicate other windows on the same room; same below would match front windows on the main structure. This is a net improvement.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with east elevation window changes. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, and Welch-aye			Certificate # HDC2022-08-6851

VI. NEW BUSINESS 12/06/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Jennifer Pincince 12-7569	4 Bloom Street	Addition & fenest. reno.	42.3.3/143	Thornewill Design
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Thornewill				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:11)	<p>Thornewill – Presented project; circa 1834. Rear middle wing existed while rear most rear addition did not.</p> <p>Backus – Individually significant per Historic survey, William Macy House. Would like visibility of French doors on west elevation; not appropriate; single existing door is appropriate for subordinate access. Add a window in the extension. Agrees with advisory group comments.</p> <p>Read advisory comments: The proposed south elevation has too many windows; eliminate one. French doors will be visible and should be a single door with a window.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees about French doors facing Bloom Street. Suggested adding a French door on south to give it a sunroom effect.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees. This time you can clearly see this.</p> <p>Coombs – Also agrees. The new addition could be smaller with a single French with flanking windows on the west. South elevation four windows might be better reduced to 3.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees about the double French doors; suggested 1 door on the left with 2 windows.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with on the west elevation to have 1 door with 2 windows to the right. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Camp, Coombs, and Welch-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7569
2.	Linda Johnson 12-7574	22 Walsh Street	Replace window	29/36	Richard Prunier
3.	Catherine Hammell 12-7575	27 East Lincoln Avenue	Replace window	42.4.1/1	Richard Prunier
4.	ReMain, LLC 12-7525	54 Main Street	Lighting	42.3.1/193	Anne Dougherty
5.	Judy Rushmore 12-7584	27 Walsh Street	Replace windows & doors	29/80	Liz Konetchy
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Liz Konetchy, Chris L Moore Design Construction				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:24)	<p>Konetchy – Presented project; asking for Andersens.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1961 Greek revival. Windows tell the story of the house; it originally had 12-over-12 windows; they were changed around 2010. Front should stay 12-over-12 and change the rest as requested. Explained the issue with surveys and why this is now contributing.</p> <p>Oliver – She has no concerns; all windows should be 6-over-6.</p> <p>Camp – Likes showing the evolution showing the 12-over-12 and 6-over-6 on the sides. The right most front elevation window should also remain 12-over-12.</p> <p>Coombs – She agrees.</p> <p>Thornewill – The 12-over-12 give it some character and should remain on the front main mass and the 8-over-8s to the left should also remain; those would have to be narrower if they go to 6-over-6 so that the panes aren't vertical.</p> <p>Welch – Given the difference in existing windows, he would okay with windows in the same room having the same muntin pattern.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 4 front elevation windows to be 12-over-12 with others going to 6-over-6 but panes to be vertically oriented. (Thornewill)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried //Camp, Oliver, Coombs, Thornewill, and Welch-aye			Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7584
6.	Elizabeth Grace 12-7595	211 Polpis Road	Sun porch addition	26/31	Val Oliver
7.	Garret Rosberg 12-7559	29 Long Pond Road	New garage	59.4/19	Val Oliver
8.	Barnes Jansen 11-7518	5b Cliff Road	New garage	41/24.1	Val Oliver
9.	William Flynn 12-7555	4 White Whale Lane	New dwelling	66/537	Topham Design
10.	White Elephant Resort 12-7560	60 Easton Street	Replace roof	42.4.1/60	T&T Roofing
11.	Robert Yordan 12-7552	23 West Chester Street	Replace roof	42.4.3/5	T&T Roofing
12.	William Hopkins 12-7557	7 Hallowell Lane	New structure	30/93	Dreamline Modular
13.	Dawn Mayhew 11-7519	13 Rhode Island Avenue	Replace roof	60.3.1/355	Moore
14.	John Hendricks 12-7586	1 Jefferson Lane	Change door	55.4.1/74.1	Emeritus
15.	Paul Brody 12-7562	11 E Street	Solar roof array	60.2.1/4	ACKSmart
16.	BPN Realty Trust 12-7524	8 Swain Street	Replace window	42.4.1/82.1	LINK
17.	Thomas Kaczmarek 12-7580	25 Walsh Street	Replace deck with dormer	29/35	LINK
18.	6 Daisy, LLC 11-7517	6 Daisy Way	New commercial	68/241	Emeritus

Proposed HDC Minutes for January 12, 2023

19. 40 OSR, LLC	40 Old South Rd 39/40	Rev. Mixed-use retail	69/10	Emeritus
20. Westmoor Club 12-7526	10 Westmoor Lane	New dwelling	41/809	JGGA
21. Westmoor Club 12-7558	105 West Chester Lane	New garage	41/805	JGGA
22. Nicholas Vita 01-7692	9 Woodbury Lane	New dwelling	41/551	Studio Ppark
23. Nicholas Vita	9 Woodbury Lane	Pool & hardscape	41/551	Studio Ppark
24. 36 Hulbert, LLC	63 Hulbert Avenue	Foundation, siding & wnd	29/9	Emeritus

VII. OLD BUSINESS 12/13/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. 7 New Street 07-6611	7 New Street	Hardscape	55.4.1/37	Ahern
2. 41 Monomoy, LLC 10-7246	41 Monomoy road	Add roofwalk & fenest	54/79.1	Emeritus
3. Scott O'Connor	2 Hussey Street	Enclose 2 nd -floor porch	42.3.1/119	Emeritus
4. Eleven Lincoln Av 08-6917	32 Jefferson Avenue	Rev 12-5457: new dwelling	30/132	Botticelli & Pohl
5. Eleven Lincoln Av 10-7259	32 Jefferson Avenue	Hardscape	30/132	Botticelli & Pohl
6. Lisa Lawler 08-6863	80 Orange Street	New garage studio	55.1.4/24	Gryphon Architects

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes Motion Roll-call vote	None
Review Minutes	January 3, 2023
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, January 17th, 2023 @ 5:00 pm Hybrid – Zoom & 4 Fairgrounds Rd, Community Room • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:41 pm. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill, and Welch-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board