



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday January 24, 2023

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 4:06 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist; Adrian Rodriguez, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Dutra, Patten

Remote Participants: None

Absent Members: Oliver, Thornewill

Late Arrivals: Dutra, 4:10 pm

Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously

I. COMMISSION COMMENTS

1. None

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

1. Norton – This is her last Tuesday meeting with HDC
2. Ginny Clark – Here for 2-4-6 Highland Avenue; she sent a letter.
Martinez – Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development has asked that all their projects be held due to illness.
Pohl – Those projects will go to next Tuesday.

III. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Robert Puff 01-7781	2 Washing Pond	New basement entrance	31/17	Sanne Payne
2. Robert Graves 01-7768	29 Tashama Lane	Sliding door	55/461	Robert Graves
3. Sankaty Head Found. 01-7804	100 Sankaty Road	Basement area & door	49/115	NAG
4. Kristina Conley 01-7784	92 Hummock Pond Road	Rev. 08-6971: new dwelling	56/118	EMDA
5. Kathleen Krill 01-7769	15 Masaquet Avenue	Rev. 05-6344: relocate caba	80/141	Botticelli & Pohl
6. Michael Altman Et al 01-7805	37 Sankaty Head Road	Rev. MH move	48/2	BPLC
7. Michael Altman Et al 01-7806	37 Sankaty Head Road	Rev. GH move	48/2	BPLC
8. Bob Petty 01-7715	27 West Sankaty Road	Hardscape	73.4.2/7.1	Hristo Rashkov
9. Joan Bunting 01-7713	3 Pine Tree Road	Rev. Cabana	68/228	Structures Unltd
10. Playmen Dimitrov 01-7794	3 Weatherly Place	Color chg windows & door	67/950	Plamen Dimitrov
11. 14 MVR, LLC 01-7779	14 Madaquecham Valley Rd	Rev. 07-6695: fenestration	89/13	Emeritus
12. Five Day Bean, LLC 01-7778	48 Nobadeer Farm Road	Add door & window	69/36	Atlantic Landscaping
13. Lillian Papley 01-7738	11B Point Judith Lane	Alter window basement	67/176.2	Lillian Papley
14. Thomas Nelson 01-7810	129 Polpis Road	Extend rear deck	44/19.5	Seth Gottlieb
15. 5 Hillers Ln, LLC 01-7790	5 Hillers Lane	Rev. 12-7533: shed	42.3.2/18	JB Studio

Voting Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten

Alternates None

Recused Pohl

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate # **HDC2023-01-(as noted)**

IV. CONSENTS WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Chris & Ashley Austin 01-7787	Maple Lane Lot 7	Pool & fencing	67/303	Emeritus
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the application				
2. Jeremy Morgado 01-7716	5 Cachalot Lane	Pool & spa	67/860	Waterscapes
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the application				
3. Michael Altman Et al. 01-7786	37 Sankaty Head Road	Rev. pool & spa	48/2	BPC
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the application				
4. David Lazowski 01-7726	18 Parson Lane	Spa	45/102	MCA+
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the application				
5. Family Ties ACK, LLC 01-7775	11 Alliance Lane	Rev. 11-5125: relocate pool	39/24.1	Atlantic Landscaping
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the application				
6. ACK 15 CHK, LLC HELD	8 Chuck Hollow Road	Pool & hardscape	72/31	Atlantic Landscaping
• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the application				
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Dutra			
Documentation	Correspondence			
Representing	None			
Public	Jascin Leonardo Finger			
Concerns	Finger – She sent a letter of concern regarding 8 Chuck Hollow Road. Welch – Points were raised in the letter that should be discussed. It would be unfair to discuss this without the applicant being here.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Items 1-5. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2023-01-(as noted)
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, January 26. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

V. VIEW

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Jake Dwyer 10-7214	11 Mississippi Avenue	Pool & hardscape	59.1/233	Waterscapes
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Dutra			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Jessie Dutra, Waterscapes			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:16)	Dutra – Reviewed project. Mississippi Avenue ends at their driveway. There is no visibility from Arkansas Avenue. Coombs – This is tenuous because the vegetation’s survival depends on the weather. Round the edges of the deck. Camp – She’d like some additional screening to ensure it isn’t visible. Backus – Structure is circa 1983 non-contributing in the VR district and requires Zoning Board of Appeals approval. Based on the photos, she believes it won’t be visible. Thinks the deck edges are hard for such an informal area as Madaket and HDC should attach the proviso and recommend Madaket-appropriate plants. Patten – Agrees about additional vegetation. Welch – Also agrees with our visibility caveat.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with softening the edges of the pool and extra indigenous vegetation to screen from the cul-de-sac. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7214

VI. NEW BUSINESS 12/06/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Westmoor Club 12-7526	10 Westmoor Lane	New dwelling	41/809	JGGA
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Adam Davis, J. Graham Goldsmith Architects			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:26)	Davis – Presented project, white trim with green sashes and shutters. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7526
2. Westmoor Club 12-7558	105 West Chester Lane	New maintenance garage	41/805	JGGA
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Adam Davis, J. Graham Goldsmith Architects			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:33)	Davis – Presented project, white trim and garage doors with green sashes. Welch – It's not visible so his concerns are moot. Coombs – She would prefer the garage doors be Essex green. Camp – The windows on the south elevation should be larger. Dutra – Nothing to add.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south elevation windows to go to "A" and garage doors to go to Essex green. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7558
3. Margaret Manganaro Tr 01-7750	7 Summer Street	Repair & replace	42.3.3/114	Ned Paul
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten			
Alternates	Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Ned Paul			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:38)	Paul – Presented project Backus – Circa 1790 typical Nantucket; this rear ell is probably original to the structure. Photos are not enough to vet this proposed work and need more details. What's been submitted is insufficient. You can see this rear ell from the Hadwin House. Welch – Agrees we need supplemental information and a floor plan showing what is proposed to be modified. With these CMUs, the portion is original and wants to know what portions of the work are the photos coincide. Asked if they are replacing the CMUs or other portions of the foundation. It's hard to tell but in the photos one portion looks very small and another looks very large. Need a simple drawing and more photos showing more area. Pohl – there are very old board spliced with more modern material.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information: site plan, simple floor plan, and images from farther back and to come back Tuesday, Jan 31. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

VII. OLD BUSINESS 12/13/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. 7 New Street 07-6611	7 New Street	Hardscape	55.4.1/37	Ahern
Voting	Camp, Welch, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC			
Public	Milton Rowland, Historic Structures Advisory Group (HSAG)			
Concerns (4:49)	<p>Ahern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – MH circa 1990s within the old historic district (OHD). Appreciate the changes.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: No concerns, but the air-conditioning units (A/C) should be screened with fencing.</p> <p>No concerns with the A/C fenced in.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the A/C screened with fencing. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	HDC2022-07-6611	
2. 41 Monomoy, LLC 10-7246	41 Monomoy road	Add roofwalk & fenest	54/79.1	Emeritus
3. Scott O'Connor 01-7235	2 Hussey Street	Enclose 2nd floor porch	42.3.1/119	Emeritus
4. Eleven Lincoln Av 10-7259	32 Jefferson Avenue	Hardscape	30/132	Ahern
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC			
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG			
Concerns (4:52)	<p>Ahern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – Belgium block and gravel is consistent. No concerns.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: No concerns.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2022-10-72590	
5. Lisa Lawler 08-6863	80 Orange Street	New garage studio	55.1.4/24	Gryphon Architects
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Ethan Griffin, Gryphon Architects			
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG			
Concerns (4:59)	<p>Griffin – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – MH circa 1837 Greek revival built by John Nicholson. Appreciate the changes; would like to see previous the submittal with these proposed changes. The dormers should be removed entirely to make this very simple; at least reduce the windows. The existing batten door is appropriate, but the transom is not a traditional detail. Asked about the visibility of the year from Union.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: The garage doors should be as simple as possible with no transom. The wide shed dormer on the south will be visible and should be broken up into smaller dormers. The lattice pent roof should be removed.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with comments made. The original design is more appropriate in context with the front structure. He'd like to see the previous submittal at this height and the Greek revival trim package.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees.</p> <p>Pohl – He doesn't like the lattice pent roof.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the pent roof and transom removed and Greek revival casings. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6863	

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 12/20/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	3 Step Lane, LLC 01-7678	3 Step Lane	New commercial building	42.4.2/44	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, Ethan McMorrow Design Associates Douglas Kallfelz, Managing Partner Union Studio Architects Kara Babcock, Associate Union Studio Architects				
Public	Arthur Reade, Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, & Gifford LLP Milton Rowland, HSAG Kevin Davidson, 4 Step Lane Susan Renzulli, 5A Step Lane				
Concerns (5:09)	<p>McMorrow – Rebuild the Veranda House Inn more historically correct with modifications to meet the Building Code.</p> <p>Kallfelz – Presented project. South elevation, the door with articulated trim is now for the egress stairs. The 5th floor balcony is for service equipment. The wider north elevation is to accommodate egress stairs. The adjacent building to the north is about 5’ away. The only expansion to the footprint is eastward into the lawn. It’s likely the service area could be reduced based upon the equipment.</p> <p>Backus – The applicant and team were very proactive with reaching out to staff and going over these plans; a lot of historic details are being brought back. She has no concerns.</p> <p>Rowland – HSAG didn’t get to see the elevation. The changes to detailing are great. The 4th floor dormer and balcony are new elements, and he wants to see those more clearly.</p> <p>Camp – Confirmed the 4th-floor dormer is for the elevator; would like it dropped off the roof. East elevation, the antique brick mortar should be historic and lime-colored, and the French door should have a kick panel.</p> <p>Welch – Asked when the pre-fire conditions were done (1970s). His concern is for areas where there is new mass and the tight 5th-floor balcony. North elevation, the expansion left to right changes a lot of the characteristics as well as the expansion of the decks. East elevation as seen from the north, asked if the decks are deeper (no). The north won’t be very visible. He appreciates the less normalized fenestration pattern of the 1970s revision, but that went with the informal package whereas this is very formal.</p> <p>Coombs – She prefers the stick brackets. Agrees with Mr. Welch about the top-floor dormer as seen from the south; it upsets the roof line. The north elevation is unnecessarily severe; the exterior stairs made it livelier.</p> <p>Dutra – West elevation, the utility balcony box has a flat roof; suggested the balusters go all the way to the end. Asked how much wider this is east to west (3’); the interior is driving the exterior; south elevation, the main mass is the main view of the structure.</p> <p>Davidson – He’s concerned about footprint creep. Confirmed the northwest corner exterior stairs are now gone. Confirmed the egress changes were necessitated by code.</p> <p>Renzulli – Mr. Davidson asked many of her questions. The articulated door moved to the south elevation changes the look of the building. We’ve never had access to the drawings. The east elevation is more imposing with more decks and windows. Confirmed the north, west, and south are going back right where they were.</p> <p>Reade – Under Nantucket Zoning Bylaw in the event of a disaster, we are entitled to rebuild within 2 years of the event. We have met with Planning Staff and Building Commissioner, and we don’t need any zoning relief.</p> <p>Pohl – We won’t see the north elevation at any distance. Agrees with what’s been said. Many of the abutter concerns would be addressed at the Planning Board or Zoning.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
	Break 5:57 to 6:10 pm				
Motion	Motion to reopen. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the roof deck railing to be minimized as much as possible. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
				Certificate #	
				Certificate #	
				Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7678

2.	Balaji Gandhi	01-7686	9 New Jersey Avenue	MH addition	60.3.1/408	Shelter 7
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten					
Alternates	Dutra					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, advisory comments, and <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind (BWNIM)</i> .					
Representing Public	Jason Olbres, Shelter 7					
Concerns (6:14)	<p>Olbres – Presented project; he believes the existing has a mix of 2-over-2 and 6-over-6.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1938 “Cape-ish”. Size of existing to proposed is not clear. The 2-story gable addition is inappropriate and changes the character of this Madaket cottage. The site is changing its access to Ames Street. Belgium block apron is not appropriate for the Smith’s Point area; she questions the need for an apron off Ames; need to know the driveway material. Steppingstones are too formal and not appropriate in Madaket. South elevation, the 6-light, 3-panel, French doors are not appropriate; removing the shed above the eaves and adding windows eliminates the entrance and proposed 6-light door is not appropriate. The addition should be shorter in height and simpler; 2nd-story deck is very large not in compliance with <i>BWNIM</i>. The windows should remain 6-over-6. West elevation, exterior chimney is not appropriate and the “A” windows are very large for that elevation. North elevation, changing this to the front façade and 6-light door are not appropriate; adding ganged windows is introducing a new element. East elevation, the 6-light door with balcony is not appropriate. The orientation to the street should remain with a shorter addition and no balconies and no 6-light doors. The proposed changes would hinder this structure’s contributing status.</p> <p>Camp – It’s lost all its charm. The start is a low building with a lot of Madaket character. The proposal is a totally different animal. The design should be more in keeping with the original.</p> <p>Coombs – It should be more “campy” to fit in out there.</p> <p>Patten – She doesn’t have anything to add.</p> <p>Welch – This is a great example of why HDC should bring up an article that rewards people with additional groundcover by going with 1-story. A larger 1-story would be much more appropriate and blend into the lot. Agrees that the 2-story structure is too tall and boxy on a rambling 1-story cottage.</p> <p>Pohl – The 2 story is a loss of funkiness, which is very contextual to Madaket’s unique vernacular of charming disorder. The 2-story addition leaps out and detracts.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)					
Vote	Carried unanimously				Certificate #	
3.	Balaji Gandhi	01-7691	9 New Jersey Avenue	Grg fenestration change	60.3.1/408	Shelter 7
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten					
Alternates	Dutra					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, advisory comments, and <i>BWNIM</i> .					
Representing Public	Jason Olbres, Shelter 7					
Concerns (6:26)	<p>Olbres – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Same vintage as the home, 1939; photos of the existing garage would help. The dormer doesn’t comply with <i>BWNIM</i>. The new windows are very large; should be reduced in scale. The 9-light 2-panel door is appropriate, but the 6-light sliders are not but masked by the existing garage door; however, she’s concerned about what they look like when the garage doors are open. Need photos or a view.</p> <p>Coombs – The height isn’t on the plans. The dormer over the garage doors is not appropriate. Keep it simple.</p> <p>Camp – This is iconic in its simplicity; adding the dormer takes away from it.</p> <p>Welch – Simplify the garage doors possibly with a light batten or tongue and groove. Downsize the west elevation windows. The dormer roof pitch could be shallower and the dormer smaller; the proposed isn’t consistent with the character.</p> <p>Patten – Agrees about the smaller windows.</p> <p>Pohl – The west elevation windows should be smaller; either make the dormer flatter and smaller or delete.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)					
Vote	Carried unanimously				Certificate #	
4.	Balaji Gandhi	01-7736	9 New Jersey Avenue	Add shed	60.3.1/408	Shelter 7
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten					
Alternates	Dutra					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing Public	Jason Olbres, Shelter 7					
Concerns (6:32)	<p>Olbres – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Fenestration should match the other structures; it’s too tall at 13’2.75” and should be reduced.</p> <p>Welch – These garage doors are appropriate and should be used on the garage.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)					
Vote	Carried unanimously				Certificate #	

5.	3 Wingspread, LLC 01-7680	3 Wingspread Lane	New garage/dwelling	27/17.6	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, Ethan McMorrow Design Associates				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:35)	McMorrow – Presented project. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7736
6.	Andrew Barrett 01-7706	17 Pine Tree Road	Addition	68/31	Topham Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Brenda Johnson, Topham Design				
Public					
Concerns (6:42)	Johnson – Presented project. Camp – Confirmed there are 2-story structures around it and that the footprint doesn't change. Coombs – The east elevation is busy but it's okay. Dutra – The stairs make it very busy but he can't see a way to fix that. North elevation, the 2 nd -floor flanking windows should be spread apart to fill the wall. Patten – Nothing to add. Pohl – The north elevation will be visible and Mr. Dutra's suggestion is good.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the 2nd-floor windows aligned over the 1st-floor windows. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7706
7.	NFI Realty Trust 01-7688	169 Eel Point Road	New garage/studio	33/5	MCA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:39)	Mills – Presented project. No concerns, not visible.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7706
8.	Holly Coburn 01-7696	5 North Beach Street	Move off/demo	42.4.1/92	Normand Residential
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ben Normand, Normand Residential				
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG				
Concerns (6:53)	Normand – Presented project; we have people who are looking to take the 1930s portion. Backus – Per HDC survey, circa 1930s contributing renovated in 2017. This should not be demolished. It's within the OHD. We need more information such as aerials, Sanborne maps, and old plans. Rowland – Read advisory comments: This is a contributing building built in 1930. A move off is reasonable, but it should not be demolished. Consensus agrees with a move off but no demolition. Pohl – He'd be okay with demolishing the 2017 addition.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move off for 1930 portion; demolition of 2017 addition is acceptable. (Dutra)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7696

9.	Holly Coburn 01-7695	5 North Beach Street	New dwelling	42.4.1/92	Normand Residential
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ben Normand, Normand Residential				
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG				
Concerns (7:02)	<p>Normand – Presented project; elevated to meet flood plain requirements; it's 23.5' wide.</p> <p>Backus – This will have to comply with “Resilient Nantucket” Chapter 11; should provide an elevation certificate. This fronts on North Beach and Cornish. It introduces a different vernacular in gable forward. The attached garage off Cornish is a big change and she foresees issues. Not sure this is a vernacular HDC is looking for; matches South Carolina developments. Streetscape helps. Asked what the inspiration might be.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: Gable end windows would look better as a 4-light - a little narrower and taller to achieve vertical panes. With projecting rake boards, the rake trim should indicate a 1x8 or 1x10 sub-rake against the building. Porch posts might improve by widening a little. Window caps on the windows. Adding shutters on the front would be a bonus. All trim would benefit from beefing up a little. An old Victorian house would have white or grey painted trim rather than natural trim. The rear 6-light door should be changed to a 12-light with kick panel. The skylight might be visible.</p> <p>Dutra – Need more detail. It looks tall; suggested a water-table line might help.</p> <p>Coombs – Would like to see more additive massing; looking down on it, it's a rectangle. Doesn't think shutters would be operable due to how tight the windows are.</p> <p>Patten – Likes the idea of the water line.</p> <p>Camp – The little gable windows should be 4-lights. South elevation; the skirt lattice should have wider spacing; would be okay with shutters; the porch columns should be thicker. The fascia strip should be thick.</p> <p>Pohl – He'd support dropping the pitch to 11/12; that would bring the height down to be more in line with its neighbors. Likes the idea of shutters and 4-light gable-end windows.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and an engineer's certificate. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	
10.	James Reyes 01-7735	15 Walsh Street	Fence replacement	42.4.1/51	Liz Konetchy
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Liz Konetchy				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:14)	<p>Konetchy – Presented project. The hedge is gone.</p> <p>Backus – This is outside the OHD. MH is circa 1979. The 5&1 lattice detail should be square.</p> <p>No concerns with square lattice.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with square lattice. (Dutra)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7735
11.	2 Highland Ave, LLC 01-7685	2.4.6 Highland Avenue	New dwelling	30/189	Emeritus
12.	2 Highland Ave, LLC 01-7684	2.4.6 Highland Avenue	New 2 nd dwelling	30/189	Emeritus
13.	Kevin Davidson 01-7681	4 Step Lane	Addition	42.4.2/82	Emeritus

14. StarkPoint, LLC 01-7705					
	16 Easton Street	Rev. 09-6993: main house	42.1.4/11	Botticelli & Pohl	
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG				
Concerns (7:19)	Botticelli – Presented project. Backus – This was approved recently. The shingle flair and removing the corner boards are appropriate; look at where the shingle line is as there is a lot of space below the windows. The brick piers look out of proportion; referred back to the previous approval. Rowland – Read advisory comments: Ok with arch over front entry, but it should be shallower to reveal more of the porch beam in the middle. Ok with the shingle flare, but the shingle line has dropped creating too much shingled area below the windows and it adds another panel below the windows to the right; the shingle line should remain where it was – roughly a foot or so below the floor level. The brick piers should be located where a natural structural support would be – not just at the corners; as shown, the spans are uncomfortably long; suggested they be thinner. Dutra – Likes the changes. Agrees the arch should be shallower or upper piece narrower. Coombs – Agrees with HSAG comments. This is a stand-out building and interesting. Camp – Agrees about the front-door arch; suggested shorter columns to give more to the arch. Agrees the shingle flair being too low. Patten – Nothing to add. Welch – Mr. Rowland’s comments covered it. On homes where it’s appropriate, this treatment helps with the nature of the vertical change. Agrees the shingle flair should be a couple of courses below the original shingle line.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the shingle line and flair raised to the previous shingle line; the arch to be deeper; and piers inserted in the middle of spans more than 15’. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7705	
15. 32 Hulbert Trust 01-7704					
	32 Hulbert Avenue	Rev. 09-7037: fenestration	29/72	Botticelli & Pohl	
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:33)	No documentation; no action at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, January 26. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
16. The Brant, LLC 12-7612					
	6&8N.Beach/4 Dolphin	New building	42.4.1/65.2	Linda Williams	
17. The Brant, LLC					
	6&8N.Beach/4 Dolphin	New pool	42.4.1/65.2	Linda Williams	
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp,				
Alternates	Dutra, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:35)	No action at this time.				
Motion	Held for Thursday, January 26				
Vote	N/A		Certificate #		
18. John Buttrick 12-7608					
	26 Warren’s Landing Rd	MH fenestration change	38/11.3	Linda Williams	
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:38)	Williams – Presented project. No material concerns. Pohl – Some existing elevations are labeled as proposed.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with sheet A2.01 corrected to reflect existing elevation. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7608	

19. John Buttrick	12-7609	26 Warren's Landing Rd	Rebuild pool & structure	38/11.3	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:48)	<p>Williams – You have to look at the pictures. It's not visible. Rebuilding in kind. Welch – Confirmed the siding is all vertical board. It's atypical and existing but not visible. No concerns due to no visibility.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility and through staff not visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7609
20. John Buttrick	12-7607	26 Warren's Landing Rd	New 2 nd dwelling	38/11.3	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:46)	<p>Williams – Presented project. No concerns due to no visibility.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7607
21. QV3 Nom Trust	12-7611	22 Vestal Street	Move off cottage	41/39	Linda Williams
22. NT Quaker Project, LLC	12-7610	14 Quaker Road	Move on cottage	41/176	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten				
Alternates	Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG				
Concerns (7:53)	<p>Williams – Presented project. Backus – Circa 1940s contributing, Tigerlily. Appreciates it's being saved. Rowland – Read advisory comments: No concerns. No concerns with the move off-move on.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve the move off from 22 Vestal Street and move onto 14 Quaker Road. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7611/7610
23. NT Quaker Project, LLC	11-7605	14 Quaker Road	MH replace windows	41/176	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten				
Alternates	Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG				
Concerns (7:59)	<p>Williams – Presented project. Objects to allowing HSAG comments. Backus – Non-contributing 1995 colonial. The new small window in the dormer is visible and odd in its symmetry; recommend keeping the dormer as is. Rowland – Read advisory comments: The dormer window change is very visible and disrupts the consistency of the window pattern; it should remain as 4 identical windows. Welch – In his opinion, the smaller bathroom window is not an issue; it's not inappropriate. Camp – Leave the dormer the way it is. Coombs – There are windows in bathrooms; sees no reason to change the dormer. Patten – No issue. Pohl – No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-11-7605

IX. OLD BUSINESS 01/03/23

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Jason Mendelson 10-7302	7A Sherburne Turnpike	New studio	31/112.1	Studio Ppark
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	James Krapp, Studio Ppark			
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG			
Concerns (8:07)	<p>Krapp – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Explained how he can reduce the height 18”.</p> <p>Backus – Infill within Sherburne Heights subdivision. Appreciate changes. The nano-door is atypical and should be screened. The break-up of the dormer is odd; still very vertical.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: This building is unnecessarily tall and could be lowered a foot by reducing the ceiling height of the first floor 6” and lowering the 2nd-floor windows and plates another 6”. The 3’ wide sliver of a gable is inappropriate; a secondary gable addition should be much deeper to represent an entire room – not to be used as a decorative add-on. The west dormer is too wide and should be split up.</p> <p>Coombs – The lot is overly busy with too much going on. It’s too tall and should come down. West elevation 1st-floor windows should be separated and align under the 2nd-floor windows. The design of the dormer makes this top-heavy.</p> <p>Dutra – Agree with the height. There’s a lot of space between the 1st-floor headers and 2nd-floor sills. Okay with the dormers.</p> <p>Camp – It’s too tall and too big and squished into the corner; if it were smaller, it would be okay.</p> <p>Patten – Nothing to add.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees about the gratuitous gable appendage; it prevents having more windows on the gable end of the main mass; treat it like a shed-roof bay.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the height reduced 18” and the south elevation gable bump out to be a shed roof over the triple doors with 2nd-floor windows in the main mass. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7302	
2. Sherburne Tpk, LLC 10-7305	7A Sherburne Turnpike	Pool & hardscape	30/112.1	Atlantic Landscaping
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Dutra, Patten			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Lindsay Congleton, Atlantic Landscaping			
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG			
Concerns (8:22)	<p>Congleton – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Pool equipment to be in studio basement.</p> <p>Backus – Appreciates the reduction of the pool and Belgium block edging and removal of the patio and firepit. Would prefer more green space around the pool.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: The driveway doesn’t need to be 12’ wide, 10 or 11 feet is plenty.</p> <p>Dutra – Appreciates the reduction in the pool and patio. He doesn’t want to see a large wall of Leland Cyprus.</p> <p>Coombs – There’s no green along the north side, just hedge.</p> <p>Camp – If it weren’t pushed into the corner, the pines could be planted more naturally. If the spa were removed, the pool would be smaller but a normal size.</p> <p>Patten – Asked about the River birch. Agrees about reducing the driveway.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the driveway entrance to be 10’ wide and not using Leland Cyprus and the pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter and to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application. (Dutra)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7305	
Rest held				
3. Tigerlily Nom 10-7289	7 Barnabas Lane	New dwelling	41/563	Studio Ppark
4. Kathryn Cook 10-7257	85 Low Beach Road	New dwelling MH	75/31.3	Michael Bard
5. Kathryn Cook 10-7217	85 Low Beach Road	New dwelling garage	75/31.3	Michael Bard
6. Kathryn Cook 01-7746	85 Low Beach Road	Pool house	75/31.3	Michael Bard
7. 10 York, LLC 10-7291	10 York Street	Doors, windows & mas chg	55.4.1/142	Thornewill Design
8. 1010 Wins, LLC 10-7136	10 Lincoln Avenue	Demo/move garage	30/184	Emeritus
9. 1010 Wins, LLC 10-7117	10 Lincoln Avenue	New garage	30/184	Emeritus
10. 1010 Wins, LLC 01-7783	10 Lincoln Avenue	Cabana	30/184	Emeritus
11. 1010 Wins, LLC 10-7337	10 Lincoln Avenue	Hardscape: gate, pool & spa	30/184	Emeritus
12. SAWB Corp. 11-7453	24 Cliff Road	Addition	42.4.4/49	SCI
13. Reade, Gullicksen, etc., LLP 04-6162	42 Easton Street	Hardscape: gate & paving	42.4.1/21	‘Sconset Gardener Inc
14. John Mergrue 10-7341	36 Easton Street	New garage/apartment	42.1.4/19	EMDA

X. NEW BUSINESS 01/10/23

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Tigerlily Nom Trust 01-7689	7 Barnabas Lane	New garage	30/132	Studio Ppark

Proposed HDC Minutes for January 24, 2023

2.	Tigerlily Nom Trust 01-7671	7 Barnabas Lane	Pool & hardscape	30/132	Ahern
3.	John & Kelly Lee 01-7807	1 Ridge Lane	Addition	38/91	Gryphon Architects
4.	Salisbury Cottage, LLC 01-7737	13 Academy Lane	Reno dwelling, add dormers	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
5.	Salisbury Cottage, LLC 01-7734	13 Academy Lane	New shed	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
6.	Mark Wilmot 01-7752	35 Monomoy Road	Add shutters, replace doors	54/74	Gryphon Architects
7.	Cynthia Nelson 01-7809	30 King Street	Demo/move off	73.4.2/113	Gryphon Architects
8.	Cynthia Nelson 01-7808	30 King Street	New studio	73.4.2/113	Gryphon Architects
9.	Carlin Gifford 01-7767	4 Head of Plains	New dwelling	63/7	Gryphon Architects
10.	Carlin Gifford 01-7816	4 Head of Plains	New garag	63/7	Gryphon Architects
11.	NT Land Bank 01-7812	19 Wauwinet Road	Farmhouse addition	20/35	Normand Residential
12.	NT Land Bank 01-7753	19 Wauwinet Road	Barn fenestration change	20/35	Normand Residential
13.	NT Land bank 01-7814	19 Wauwinet Road	Stream bridge	20/35	Normand Residential
14.	Glenbeigh, LLC 01-7687	33 Nonantum Road	New garage/studio	87/49	Thornewill Design
15.	Melissa Neier 01-7725	11 Prospect Street	Roof replacement	55.4.4/42	Twig Perkins
16.	Mike Romano 01-7815	55 Easton Street	Rev. 05-6245: windows	42.4.1/86	Shelter 7
17.	Robert McCrewsky 01-7670	1A Yawkey Way	As-built new shed	69/19.1	Nate Barber
18.	Burton & Martello 01-7773	55 Meadow View Drive	New 2 nd dwelling	56/170	MCA+
19.	Burton & Martello 01-7667	55 Meadow View Drive	New pool	56/170	MCA+
20.	Chris O'Connell 01-7679	3 Upper Tawpawshaw	New dwelling	53/41	EMDA
21.	Keegan Hodges 01-7780	32 Union Street	New garage	42.3.2/85	Thornewill Design
22.	Malcolm George 01-7666	76 Baxter Road	New shed	49/42	Nate Barber
23.	41 WMR Trust 01-7785	41 West Miacomet Ave	Replace found. & addtn	86/31.1	Emeritus
24.	41 WMR Trust 01-7672	41 West Miacomet Ave	Pool & hardscape	86/31.1	Jardins Intl.
25.	Stark Point, LLC 01-7747	16 Easton Street	Rev. 04-6120	42.1.4/11	Botticelli & Pohl
26.	30 Pearl, LLC 01-7776	30 India Street	Rev. 07-6593: add window	42.3.4/137	Botticelli & Pohl
27.	Kerlin & Jason Hempel 01-7761	17 Orange Street	Window change	42.3.2/12	Stephen & Company
28.	Patrick & Carolyn DePalma	3 Westerwick Drive	Pool & hardscape	73/37	Carolyn DePalma

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes Motion Vote	January 3 & 10, 2023: Welch – He has edits for these two sets of minutes; asked they be held. Hold for Mr. Welch's edits. N/A
Review Minutes	January 12 & 17, 2023
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Thursday, January 26th, 2023 @ 1:00 pm Hybrid – Zoom & 2 Fairgrounds Rd, Conference Room • Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:32 pm. (Welch)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Nantucket Old Historic District

Scotset Old Historic District

Madaket Old Village