



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, February 4, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl.

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: Dutra
Late Arrivals: Thornewill, 1:04 p.m.; Camp, 1:07 p.m.
Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Welch, Carrie, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

V. NEW BUSINESS CARRIED OVER

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Edward Ahneman 01-2811	26 Sesapana Road	Solar rooftop	68/98	Cotuit Solar
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Coombs off due to technical difficulties			
Recused	Thornewill			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spread sheet.			
Representing	Karen Alence, Cotuit Solar			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:06)	Alence – Presented project; not visible. Camp – No concerns. Oliver – This is a good solar application. Welch – It meets our guidelines, no concerns. McLaughlin – No comments.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-01-2811
2. Caroline Baltzer 01-2775	66 Hulbert Avenue	Add window	29/55	Sconset Gardener
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	Coombs still having technical issues.			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Caroline Baltzer, owner			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:11)	Baltzer – Presented project. Backus – The outdoor shower was approved on a previous application; this is just for the window. HSAB didn't look at this. Oliver – No concerns; this isn't a historical house. Camp – It'll be an anomaly, but she's okay with it. Welch – No concerns. McLaughlin – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin Welch, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-01-2775

3.	Linda Del Vecchio 01-2766	11 Beach Street Sias	As built wndw + door change	73.1.3/25	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, window and door schedule, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Del Vecchio Gilbert, owner Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:17)	<p>Williams – Presented project; won't be able to tell windows are simulated-divided light (SDL) due to distance from road.</p> <p>Del Vecchio Gilbert – The contractor was supposed to pull the permits. Also asking for a mahogany, 6-light door.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: recommend a triple-track storm over SDL window. This is "Gone Native."</p> <p>Camp – The changes are good.</p> <p>Coombs – Okay with the door change though would prefer it be a 9-light like the existing door. This is in the 'Sconset old historic district (OHD) and should have true-divided light (TDL) windows.</p> <p>Pohl – The former door had a screen over it; asked if the new door will have a screen. We're holding the meeting up for the picture of the proposed door.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for complete information. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
4.	36 Washing Pond, LLC01-2813	36 Washing Pond Road	New dwelling	31/13.3	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:29)	<p>Kotchen – Presented project; primary visibility is from the north and west; everything will be pulled out of the 100-foot buffer to the coastal banks. The siding on the 1-story element is horizontal ship latt; feels east and south elevations won't be visible.</p> <p>Coombs – East elevation, the 2-story window is an issue. Some mullied windows should be separated. North elevation has 3-doors on the 2nd-floor and 4 on the 1st with wide-pane windows; this will be visible from the water. West elevation is all mullied windows; should be separated and fenestration reduced. South elevation, she would prefer two 2nd-floor windows. Grey trim with black sash is too modern; that doesn't work if you're going for a rebuild of old houses.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees about reducing the fenestration on the west and the north. Okay with the massing.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Front elevation, the window should be centered over the front door.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with what's been said. This lot is very close to the beach and the black sash is going to be too harsh; all grey would be subtler. She's concerned the complex has too many large buildings on the site; the project be scaled down.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees with comments made so far.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Oliver, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
5.	36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2808	36 Washing Pond Road	New guest house	31/13.3	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:46)	<p>Kotchen – Presented project; connected to main house by sub-surface tunnel; east and south elevations have no visibility; north elevation hidden from the beach by the main house; west elevation has some visibility.</p> <p>McLaughlin – East elevation, the 2-story "E" window is too large for the wall and awkward with the other windows: should be two windows vertically aligned, one on the 1st-floor and one on the 2nd floor; the 5 ganged doors should be reduced to three. West elevation, reduce the doors to three each.</p> <p>Coombs – West elevation, the shed dormer cheek walls should be pulled in tighter to the windows and ganged windows separated; the sliders should be 6-lights. Appreciates the size and shape of the structure.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciates the scale. It would be good if the floor plans went in the same direction as the site plan. Agrees about the window changes. The chimneys are stone; would like a better picture of the proposed material.</p> <p>Camp – She is still concerned about the scale of the overall project and the lot being over developed. This is a pretty large guesthouse; it could be half this size.</p> <p>Pohl – Nothing to add. The black sash might be too much for this location given the number of windows.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

Proposed HDC Minutes for February 4, 2021

6.	36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-1814	36 Washing Pond Road	Garage	31/13.3	Workshop APD
7.	36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2807	36 Washing Pond Road	Gym	31/13.3	Workshop APD
8.	36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2810	36 Washing Pond Road	Shed	31/13.3	Workshop APD
9.	36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2809	36 Washing Pond Road	Pool - hardscape	31/13.3	Jardins Intl.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp,				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:58)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main house and guesthouse. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #

10. Melanie Gowen 12-2621	5 Boyers Alley	Shed	55.4.1/96	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Thornewill			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments			
Representing	Val Oliver, for Melanie Gowen			
	Melanie Gowen, owner			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:58)	<p>Oliver – She was at HSAB when this came up; presented the project and changes made per HSAB comments.</p> <p>Gowen – The door faces the shell driveway. The fence abuts the side of the shed; the shed is 13 feet long.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: design is good; application still says 12-over-12 windows; questions the length and location of the fence.</p> <p>Thornewill – No concerns.</p> <p>Camp – She’d prefer just a window facing Boyers Alley; the proposed is a service door.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Camp. Changed her mind and thinks it’s okay.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Pohl – He’s okay with the door facing the driveway.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin, Carrie, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; Camp-nay			Certificate # HDC2020-12-2621

V. OLD BUSINESS CARRIED OVER

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	30 Meadow View, LLC 11-2328	30 Meadow View Drive	Pool – hardscaping	56/138	Gryphon Architects
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin, Gryphon Architects				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:09)	<p>Griffin – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; the wall is about 30-36 inches tall for the pool’s infinity edge; east elevation, the wall attached to the house is tall because it’s designed as a parapet but will have plants in front of it.</p> <p>Camp – Okay with it as presented.</p> <p>Coombs – Asked if the wall is holding back land; it seems tall. It will be hard to see.</p> <p>Oliver – Believes it will be visible from the side. Doesn’t understand what the retainage is actually doing. The east wall attached to the house looks very tall.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate # HDC2020-11-2328	

2.	14 Lowell Place, LLC 10-2188	14 Lowell Place	New dwelling	41/164	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	Jeff Marsh, 10 Lowell Place Victoria Rakov, 12 Lowell Place Zander Farkas, 9 Barnabas Lane and 20 Woodbury Place				
Concerns (2:17)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. The rear section is 1 story and probably not that visible; this is a fairly large parcel; doesn't agree with the notion that the structure needs to come down further; it's only 25 feet.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: doors too tall; shed dormers too tall; too tall and too long and not in scale with neighborhood; suggested ell-shaped wrapping around pool.</p> <p>Marsh – Our house is circa 1928; our request to add a large, gable 2nd-floor was rejected as not being in keeping with the neighborhood. This is 2242sf footprint also not in keeping with the neighborhood; this should be redesigned.</p> <p>Rakov – In footprint, square footage, and height, this is not in keeping with anything on Lowell Place.</p> <p>Farkas – This will set a precedent for future sub-dividable lots on Lowell Place.</p> <p>Coombs – This is a well-designed house for anywhere else; the design doesn't work in this location. It's too long at 90+ feet and doesn't relate to any other houses on Lowell Place.</p> <p>Welch – The front 1/3rd massing is too tall; appreciates it came down a foot and few inches with respect to the change in the roof pitch. Looking at the north elevation demonstrates the overall mass. Masking that massing is better handled on the south elevation; it's not appropriate in that setting; the small gable toward the front needs to be resized. The gable facing east demonstrates where if the roof were changed to a hipped roof and did same on the left addition, which is probably bathrooms given the size of the windows. This mass is too large for this setting. Understands Ms. Coombs points.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with much that's been said. The hard part of this structure is that the oddball subdivisions are allowed; by virtue of that, the building pattern and the neighborhood settings are disturbed. Appreciates the height reduction and agrees the height is in keeping with the Woodbury general area. The issue isn't the height but the impact of the long north and south elevations; the telescoping is very organized and feels too modern. The doors are over-scaled and lend to the modernity. Likes changing the south elevation roof; simple is better.</p> <p>Pohl – Nothing to add. Agrees with some HSAB comments. Appreciates the efforts made to reduce the scale.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Coombs, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

Continued to the beginning of February 16 meeting.

3.	Frederick Hahn 12-2618	50 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	32/25.1	EMDA
4.	Grey Lady Capital 12-2381	33 Pilgrim Road	Cabana addition	41/834	JB Studio
5.	Andrew Reger 12-2469	7 East Lincoln Avenue	New dwelling	42.4.1/8	Emeritus
6.	103 Main Street 12-2577	103 Main Street	Spa + hardscape	42.3.3/153	Atlantic Lndscpg
7.	William Scannell 12-2446	119R Eel Point Road	New dwelling	33/17.1	BPC
8.	William Scannell 12-2444	119R Eel Point Road	Pool	33/17.1	BPC
9.	Lynne Bolton 11-2230	4 Shell Street	Addition	73.1.3/32	Nant. Carpentry
10.	Holly Coburn 01-2789	20 Bishops Rise – Lot A	New dwelling	40/127	Normand Resid.
11.	Holly Coburn 01-2791	20 Bishops Rise – Lot A	Pool and hardscape	40/127	Normand Resis.
12.	Brett Fodiman 11-2217	111 Surfside Road	New dwelling	80/70	Emeritus
13.	Brett Fodiman 11-2210	111 Surfside Road	New garage/studio	80/70	Emeritus
14.	218 Cliff Road Assoc. 12-2461	218 Cliff Road	Main house	40/61.1	Workshop/APD
15.	218 Cliff Road Assoc. 12-2459	218 Cliff Road	New 2 nd DU/garage studio	40/61.1	Workshop/APD
16.	218 Cliff Road Assoc. 12-2400	218 Cliff Road	Pool and hardscape	40/61.1	Ahern, LLC
17.	Paul Piccirillo 10-2053	6 Baltimore Road	New dwelling	60/106	Val Oliver Design

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	January 4, 7, 8, 14, 15 & 19, 2021: no action at this time.
Review Minutes	January 21, 26, & 28, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday 2/16/21 at 04:30pm • HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Discussion of 6 Fair Street Minimum Maintenance • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:43 p.m. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

