



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, February 23, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 4:34 p.m. and announcements by Ms. Coombs and Mr. Welch

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: Pohl, Dutra
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: Welch, 8:08 p.m. lost connection

Adoption of the Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve the Agenda as drafted. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 6-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Nantucket Old South, LLC 02-3006	33 Old South Road	Demo due to fire	68/4	Linda Williams
2. Reel Keeper, LLC 02-3007	10 Surfside Drive	Wind/door/trim color chg	67/332	Linda Williams
3. James Cabral 02-2998	19 Clarendon Street	Fence/gate	76.1.3/100	Linda Williams
4. Thomas Coyne 02-2953	34 Union Street	Shed	42.3.2/86	Salt Spray Sheds
5. Kenneth Graham 02-3005	6 Jackson Street #2	Roof change	73.1.3/61.2	JB Studio
6. Catch Fish, LLC 02-3001	19 Main Street	Roof change	42.3.1/214.1	James Lydon
7. Robert Burke 02-3002	31 Baxter Road	Roof change	49.2.3/8	Phil Patterson
8. Caroline Baltzer 02-2966	66 Hulbert Avenue	Steps/outdoor shower	29/55	Sconset Gardner
9. Linda Gilbert 02-2948	11 Beach Street, Sias	Hardscape – fence/arbor	73.1.3/25	Linda Williams
10. Nan. Island Land Bank 02-2933	44 Washington Street	Move off to 5 Meader Street	42.2.3/7	Structures Unlimited

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch

Alternates Thornewill

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.

Representing None

Public None

Concerns **Oliver** – Asked about the trim on the shed at 34 Union Street; trim is AZEK and windows vinyl clad. Asked it be pulled off consent and moved onto consent with conditions.

Motion **Motion to Remove Item 4 from Consent and add to Consent with Conditions. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

Motion **Motion to Approve Items 1-3 and 5-10. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate # **HDC2021-02-(as noted)**

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Gerard Layden 02-2979	22 Atlantic Avenue	Add dormer/stairs	55/26	NICHE Architecture
• Updated window schedule to reflect the application				
2. Robert Middleton 02-2999	12A Surfside Drive	Outdoor shower	67/331	Jose Coutino
• Due to lack of visibility				
3. Robert Feldberg 02-3003	13 New Street	Rev. 1089: relocate AC unit	55/43.1	Gordon Folger
• Due to lack of visibility				
4. Surf Shack No. 9 02-3000	9 Longwood Drive	New dwelling	71/44	Ethan McMorrow
• Due to lack of visibility				

5.	Pack N Pine, LLC 02-3004	18 Mill Street	Fence	54.4.4/75	Natalie Cowger
	• Total length of fence to be updated on the application				
6.	Thomas Coyne 02-2953	34 Union Street	Shed	42.3.2/86	Salt Spray Sheds
	• Trim to be wood and windows to be true divided light (TDL).				
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	No further concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-(as noted)

IV. NEW BUSINESS Carried over

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	2 N. Liberty St, LLC 02-2860	2 North Liberty Street	Replace garage door	42.3.4/86	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:44)	Oliver – Presented project. Backus – Read HSAB comments: recommend garage door glass panes too vertical, recommend 8 or 10-light panel, and prefer door to be grey or Essex green. No additional concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the window panel to be 8 lights and door painted Essex green. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Thornewill, Camp, Welch, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2860
2.	Maxwell House, LLC 02-2861	32 India Street	Gate	42.3.4/152	Jardins International
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Elisabeth O'Rourke, Jardins International				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:46)	O'Rourke – Presented project; a white gate will stand out and black is used on the studio; feels dark will make them disappear. Backus – Read HSAB comments: house is a simple, Quaker design; gate should be simple with flat top and should be painted white, not black. Oliver – The window and black panels in the studio were not approved and received a violation citation. She'd prefer a color other than white, suggested natural to weather. Camp – White gates and white picket fences are the norm; we have no dark gates. She's okay with the proposed if the gates are white. Thornewill – Agrees natural to weather would be good. McLaughlin – Muted; no comments or vote.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the gates to be natural to weather. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2861
3.	Quidnet Develop., LLC 02-2940	34 Quidnet Path	New dwelling	21/53	Concise Design Grp
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Falkenstein, Concise Design Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:55)	Falkenstein – Presented project; Quidnet Path is for the exclusive use for the four houses in this development. Oliver – This is the same design as 26 Quidnet Path. No concerns. McLaughlin – Muted; no comments or vote.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Welch, Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2940

4.	Quidnet Develop., LLC 02-2939	34 Quidnet Path	Garage	21/53	Concise Design Grp
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Falkenstein, Concise Design Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:00)	Falkenstein – Presented project; identical in size to garage at 26 Quidnet Path. No concerns. McLaughlin – Muted; no comments or vote.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2939
5.	Christine Petrella 02-2954	16 Pequot Street	Pool & move driveway	80/320	Self
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	McLaughlin technical difficulties				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Larry Petrella, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:02)	Petrella – Presented project. Camp – No concerns as long as we have the visibility caveat for the pool. Thornewill – Concerned that the vegetation will not be thick enough. Welch – Looking at the aerial, the brush is a little thinner; okay with the concept but should hold for a final review of the landscape plan showing where plants will be supplemented.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with submission of a landscape planting plan and the pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Welch, Thornewill, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2954
6.	Sharon Hubbard 02-2943	28 Dukes Road	Pool and hardscape	56/190	Waterscapes
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver// McLaughlin reconnecting				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Gary King, Waterscapes				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:10)	King – Presented project; sits 10 feet off the property line at the closest point; could add a vegetative buffer; 15X30. Camp – She wants to view because of what's happened on Dukes Road in the past. Wants to see a site plan with a planting plan and pool dimensions. Pool looks very large as depicted in the aerial photo. Thornewill – It sits really close to the property line and boxes the neighbor between two pools and retaining walls; there's room to relocate the pool. Welch – He'd like to see a landscaped plan and a scaled drawing and a site plan with the pool located on it. Two other pools in the area are 15 feet off the property line.				
Motion	Motion to View with a scaled site plan placing the pool and planting plan. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
7.	Dave Bossi 02-2894	66 Milk Street	Rooftop solar	56/9	Cotuit Solar
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.				
Representing	Karen Alence, Cotuit Solar				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:20)	Alence – Presented project; on a barn with a black roof. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2894

8.	Jonathan Pressment 02-2854	2 Ash Lane	Gas fire vent	42.4.2/93	Thornewill Design
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Thornewill				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:24)	<p>Thornewill – Presented project; we can move the vent up as much as possible.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: circa 1840, okay with choice of material; prefer vent in less visible location.</p> <p>Oliver – She’s okay; once the copper has a patina, it won’t be noticeable.</p> <p>Welch – It’s right at the height of the window; suggested raising above the line of window headers.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No concerns.</p> <p>Camp – Likes Mr. Welch’s idea of moving it up out of the line of vision.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the vent placed as high as possible. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2854	
9.	OHOM, LLC 02-2856	28 Main Street, Sias	New dwelling GH	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:29)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; flex structure: garage/guesthouse.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: questions on use and what would be visible when garage doors open; reuse historic garage doors; French doors not in keeping with batten doors; recommend a view; want to know what’s been approved versus proposed.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2856	
10.	Anthony Cirale 02-2955	58 Nobadeer Avenue	Demo/move garage/office	88/81	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:36)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; circa 2010; hopeful they can move it but not moving would prevent the approved new structure from happening. The new structure was approved on consent last week.</p> <p>Oliver – It seems this building is very worth moving.</p> <p>Welch – Okay with a move off; it should be repurposed.</p> <p>Camp – She support a move/demo.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move off. (Welch) Not carried.				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye; Welch-nay		Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2955	

11. Chandra Miller 02-2859					
	25 Bank Street, Sias	Fenst. /AC / railing	73.1.3/51	Emeritus	
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:43)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project; circa 1910; owner prefers air conditioners (A/C) on the east elevation, windows are mixed simulated divided light (SDL) and TDL; want all SDLs.</p> <p>Backus – Property is known as Whales Back. Read SAB comments: closed railing odd; SDLs not appropriate; A/C Option 2 more appropriate; south balcony door better as 12-light; shame to lose any existing TDLS and want to know which those are.</p> <p>Camp – Okay with shingling the balcony. Okay with proposed in general.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciates moving the A/C to the east; it doesn't appear any TDLS are left.</p> <p>Thornewill – SDLs are not appropriate in the old historic district (OHD).</p> <p>McLaughlin – Claims this isn't in the OHD (it is).</p> <p>Coombs – Would prefer it remain as close to original as possible: TDLS and baluster rails.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the windows on the street side to be TDL and others can be SDL and with open balusters and the A/C sited as in Option 2. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, Thornewill, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2859		
12. ACK 007, LLC 02-2971					
	46 Walsh Street	Addition	29/101.1	NAG	
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	(Oliver took a break)				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:55)	<p>Theroux – Presented project; deck would be in keeping with neighbors; deck is 7 feet deep.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: no concerns.</p> <p>Camp – It would be right up to the setback. It's kind of quirky.</p> <p>Thornewill – No concerns; doesn't think it will be visible.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with comments and HSAB.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The dimensions of the house aren't shown; can't determine if decking would meet the guidelines.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2971		
13. EBCW, LLC 02-2949					
	4 Lincoln Avenue	Move off/demo garage	30/151	Botticelli + Pohl	
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:01)	<p>Botticelli – Presented project; according to Sanborne Maps, it was built post 1949.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: Main house is circa 1915; no date indicated on this; don't support demo would prefer it be kept and repurposed. Appreciates the framing photos.</p> <p>Camp – She's fond of these hipped garages and they are throwbacks to maybe the 1940s; they are part of our history as early examples of garages. Would prefer it be repurposed on site.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciates the scale but doesn't think it needs to be kept. However, would be nice if it were reflected in what's proposed.</p> <p>Welch – This could be moved off or demolished and has limited re-use potential. Agrees about echoing the scale and silhouette in its replacement.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Hates to see garages turning into cottages; wants it to remain as is.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move-off or demolition. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-2//Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye; Camp and McLaughlin-nay	Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2949		

14. EBCW, LLC 02-2972		4 Lincoln Avenue	New garage	30/151	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:13)	<p>Botticelli – The message is very clear this needs to reflect the characteristic of the old garage. Asked this be held. She will submit additional as-built documentation on the existing garage.</p> <p>No comments at this time.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold at applicant’s request. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
15. EBCW, LLC 02-2973		4 Lincoln Avenue	Addition	30/151	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:17)	<p>Botticelli – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: Circa 1915; existing shutters are important; west wing too long; south elevation 2nd-set of French doors should be moved back; general massing acceptable but addition could be reduced to be more compact.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with HSAB about making the addition more additive. Agrees front, triple-ganged windows are overwhelming and loses rhythm of shutters. It should be simpler.</p> <p>Camp – This is getting blown up and losing its original profile; front should not be changed. South elevation, the gable dormer should be a smaller shed sitting lower on the roof. East elevation looks good. Agrees about calming the massing and keeping the historical front.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The proposed fenestration is over 50%.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with what’s been said. North elevation is most visible and iconic. Agrees with Ms. Camp about the rear and south elevations.</p> <p>Coombs – North elevation, 2nd-floor, triple windows should go back to the simple, classic façade. South elevation gable dormer should be a shed dormer or eliminated. The addition height should be lowered and extended out more to be more additive.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
16. Emily Overlook 02-2842		22 Clifton Street	New dwelling	73.4.1/26.3	Bentley & Churchill
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Elizabeth Churchill, Bentley & Churchill				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:31)	<p>Churchill – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: photos would be beneficial; not necessarily a ‘Sconset house but in keeping with immediate neighborhood; north elevation eye-brow arch atypical.</p> <p>Camp – This does have a lot of ‘Sconset in it. No concerns.</p> <p>Welch – Suggested trying to work in green shutters or change trim to green; green trim would be beneficial and more appropriate.</p> <p>Oliver – She agrees with Mr. Welch about the trim color.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation, the door has too much glass; should be a more typical door style.</p> <p>Coombs – She’d like the number of ganged windows reduced, especially on the front and west.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	

17. Emily Overlook 02-2840	22 Clifton Street	Garage	73.4.1/26.3	Bentley & Churchill
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Elizabeth Churchill, Bentley & Churchill			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:43)	Churchill – Presented project. Welch – This is charming and subject to a color change to match the house, this is approvable. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the color to match the house. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2840	
18. Emily Overlook 02-2841	22 Clifton Street	Hardscape: patio & drive	73.4.1/26.3	Bentley & Churchill
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Elizabeth Churchill, Bentley & Churchill			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:44)	Churchill – Presented project. Coombs – The corners of the patio should be rounded some to be more natural. No additional concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the patio corners rounded. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, Camp, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2841	
19. 46 Union St N.T. 02-2843	46 Union Street	Addition	42.2.3/28	M. Cutone Arch.
Voting	Camp (acting chair, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill)			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Coombs			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, advisory comments, and <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind</i> .			
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture			
Public	Diane Coombs, 44 Union Street			
Concerns (6:47)	Cutone – Presented project; circa 1909; 1 st -floor sits above flood plain and will be back for historic determination to save original foundation; cobblestone grey trim, dark grey sash and doors, and wood roof. Backus – Read HSAB comments: French doors should be 10- or 15-light; northeast elevation dormer out of balance; appreciate reusing existing front door; question new dormer on the front; existing chimney should remain; existing color more in keeping; are working on retaining foundation and relocating electricals above the flood plain. This is in keeping with the resiliency guidelines being proposed as an addendum for <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind</i> . Coombs – Extending the roof at the same height as main mass makes this a box. Built by Ricky Lewis' grandfather. The different roof levels blend in with what's existing. Front door should face Union Street. Oliver – Agree about the long, main ridge; addition roof should be stepped down to be more additive. Southwest elevation, the dormer should be smaller; dormer window is larger than any of the existing windows. Likes the existing blue trim. Thornewill – Agrees with Ms. Oliver; the chimney should remain. Southwest dormer shouldn't be detailed like the large gable forward. Welch – Agrees with comments made; the chimney would break up the perception of the ridge and massing. He'd like to see a mock-up of the trim and doors in Cobblestone and dark grey or color chips. Camp – Agrees with what's been said. The addition should be subordinate to the historic massing. Likes the blue. McLaughlin – No comment.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Camp-aye	Certificate #		
20. Melissa Long 02-2844	11 Pippen's Way	Rooftop solar	43/94.2	ACK Smart
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.			
Representing	Tobias Glidden, ACK Smart			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:06)	Glidden – Presented project. Oliver – Would like to view.			
Motion	Motion to View and to come back on Thursday, February 25. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #		

21. Michelle Currie	02-2963	7 Anna Drive	Addition	55/245.2	Josiah Newman
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Josiah Newman Daniel Southey, co-owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:09)	<p>Newman – Presented project; this should be viewed; it’s unique for Nantucket. Oliver – It is important to view this to realize that you can’t see it; this is very unusual. McCarthy – We will keep this on the agenda for Thursday.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View and to come back on Thursday. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
22. Kim Glowacki	02-2935	3B Miller Lane	Hardscape: driveway	68/120	Structures Unlimited
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Nancy Drahzal, Structures Unlimited Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:13)	<p>Drahzal – Presented project. Williams – They can’t have an apron on a dirt road. Oliver – The apron is proposed asphalt and the road is dirt; didn’t think they needed an apron into a dirt road. Camp – Doesn’t see why the driveway needs to run parallel Little Isle for so far; curb cut should be closer to the house.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the driveway to be gravel. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, Coombs-aye; Camp-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-9235
23. Hilary Cunniff	02-2946	37 York Street	Hardscape – driveway	55.4.1/104	Linda Williams
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:21)	<p>Williams – Presented project; they have two driveways; this is the one on the left. Backus – Read HSAB comments: no comments. Camp – It’s excessive for one building on York Street to have two driveways. Thornewill – Doesn’t understand why the left one wasn’t abandoned when they applied for the new driveway. If they are allowed to have it, the two driveways should be the same material rather than this going to brick. Oliver – Agrees. Brick is a disconnect; it should match the right drive. McLaughlin – Agrees. Coombs – Suggested brick with a cobble center strip. This section of York is casual; shouldn’t have formal brick.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a Belgium block apron and shell drive.				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye; Camp-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2946
24. Tidal Creeks	02-2874	11/13/15/17 Tomahawk Rd	As-built hoop barn	69/313-316	Linda Williams
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:31)	<p>Williams – Presented project; by zoning hoop barns are allowed to remain; the applicant can’t afford to build a new building at this time. Appropriate to the location.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, McLaughlin, Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2987

25. GG Development, LLC 02-2959	6 Red Mill Lane	Hardscape – pool/wall	55/919.2	Linda Williams
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	(Thornewill lost connection)			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:38)	<p>Williams – Presented project.</p> <p>Oliver – Wants to view this; there’s a lot going on.</p> <p>Welch – He wants a chance to look at it; thought, he doesn’t think he has any concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to View. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, McLaughlin, Welch, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	
26. Derek Till 02-2944	86 Quidnet Road	Lift, renovate & addition	21/102	L. Williams/NAG
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.			
Representing	Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group			
Public	Linda Williams			
Concerns (7:34)	<p>Williams – Reviewed history and photos.</p> <p>Theroux – Presented project; suggested a site visit and invited them to see the inside.</p> <p>Botticelli – Wants the Board to pay close attention to the topography of the property; she was told it would remain at 30.8; the plan shows it going as high as 32.</p> <p>Camp – Appreciates the attempt to put this back together again. There’s a lot to take in and she needs time to look it over. Likes the idea of reusing the two oldest windows and retaining the sunporch. Would appreciate any historic massing being retained.</p> <p>Thornewill – West elevation, adding so much 2nd-floor and the two gables forward and the front porch are not appropriate; would prefer the massing be kept as close to existing as possible.</p> <p>Welch – He’d like a clarification on the points Ms. Botticelli brought up. Agrees with Ms. Thornewill.</p> <p>Coombs – Prefers the massing of the original front elevation.</p>			
Motion	Motion to View and hold for revisions and to come back on Monday, March 1. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried //Camp, Thornewill, Welch, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	
27. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2980	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot A	Main house	67/176	Linda Williams
28. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2981	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot A	Cottage	67/176	Linda Williams
29. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2982	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot B	Main house	67/176	Linda Williams
30. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2983	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot B	Cottage	67/176	Linda Williams
31. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2984	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot C	Main house	67/176	Linda Williams
32. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2985	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot C	Cottage	67/176	Linda Williams
33. 61 Fairgrounds, LLC 02-2986	61 Fairgrounds Road – Lot D	Main house	67/176	Linda Williams
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:041)	<p>Williams – Asked to be continued for revisions.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold at applicant’s request. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	

34. 36 Lily St, LLC 02-2960	36 Lily Street	Demo portn of ctg/barn	42.4.3/93	Linda Williams
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Camp; Welch lost connection			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	Abby Camp, 27 Lily Street			
Concerns (8:08)	<p>Williams – Presented project, GIS says 1926; it shows on the 1923 Sanborne map; can't be moved.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: a thorough historical report should be helpful and should be required for any demolition; asked for more historical information. It was pointed out to her that there have been structures in deplorable condition, such as 6 Gull Island around the corner; this doesn't have to be a demolition with some part saved; the HDC approved the oldest portion with the front door to be saved and moved.</p> <p>Oliver – She has no concerns; there isn't any historic merit left.</p> <p>Thornewill – She agrees; it's a shame it wasn't fixed and maintained when the residential section was removed.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Anything is an improvement.</p> <p>Coombs – Okay with the demolitions.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve the demolition. (McLaughlin)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #	HDC2021-02-2960	
35. Karli Hagedorn 02-2970	34 West Chester Road	Rev. 12-2615: garage alts.	41/31	Normand Residential
36. Karli Hagedorn 02-2969	34 West Chester Road	Garden shed	41/31	Normand Residential
37. Karli Hagedorn 02-2967	34 West Chester Road	Restore existing shed	41/31	Normand Residential
38. Karli Hagedorn 02-2968	34 West Chester Road	Greenhouse	41/31	Normand Residential
39. Karli Hagedorn 02-2958	34 West Chester Road	Hardscape	41/31	Julie Jordin
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:22)	<p>McCarthy – It was requested these be held for Thursday.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, February 25. (Thornewill)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #		
40. Brian + Toni Franz 02-2974	12 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/10	Workshop/APD
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Camp stepped out			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:24)	<p>Kotchen – Presented project; double-story windows, vegetation will screen visibility of the 1st-floor sections and will be supplemented; natural trim with black sash.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: the front door is very atypical; northwest and southwest sides not appropriate; this is not a cottage design; Nr. 3 window is too tall and not appropriate; stacked windows not appropriate. Recommend additional photos for visibility.</p> <p>Thornewill – There will be a lot of houses in here; massing is simple, but the windows are too much in an area with more traditional houses.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciates the massing; it's okay except for the 2-story windows and the chimney is overly large. South elevation will probably be the most open.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The stacked, 4-over-4 windows are inappropriate and should be removed; the guidelines instruct putting larger windows on the 1st floor and smaller on the 2nd.</p>			
Motion	Motion to View and hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye	Certificate #		

41. Brian + Toni Franz 02-2975	12 Cannonbury Lane	Garage	74/10	Workshop/APD
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:34)	<p>Kotchen – Asked the Board to review the garage rather than holding to track. Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: not typical design; balcony unusual for ‘Sconset; too tall for a garage; east elevation barn door faces the street, want to know what’s behind it (opens into structure).</p> <p>Camp – Natural to weather trim and black sash are harsh for the area; okay with the design.</p> <p>Thornewill – It is simple but seems tall. Driving under a deck to enter the garage seems odd.</p> <p>Oliver – Proportion of width and height is odd; the balcony would be better integrated into a porch roof, which would mitigate the height.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Coombs – 22’7” meets our height guidelines.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main house. (McLaughlin) not carried.			
	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	
42. Brian + Toni Franz 02-2957	12 Cannonbury Lane	Shed	74/10	Workshop/APD
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:44)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	
43. Carl Nielsen 02-2947	15 Bassett Road	Shed	26/59	Ethan McMorrow
44. Romelys + Ronald Vasquez 02-2864	25 Equator Drive	New dwelling	66/257	Ethan McMorrow
45. Kenneth Sharkey 02-2870	13 West Sankaty Road	Garage	73.4.2/119	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:46)	<p>Oliver – Mr. McMorrow texted her asking these be held</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (McLaughlin)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	
46. Karli Hagedorn 02-2945	3 Wesco Place	Hardscape	41/31	Julie Jordin
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:46)	<p>McCarthy – Ms. Jordin asked to hold for Thursday.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Thursday, February 25. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	

47. Jeannine Randolph **02-2934** 22 Wigwam Road Add skirt to roof walk 77/7.9 Permits Plus
 Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns (8:47) **McCarthy** – Mark Poor isn't here.
 Not opened at this time.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

48. Gordon C. Russell **02-2898** 3 School Street Addition 42.3.2/125 Flavin Architects
 49. Gordon C. Russell **02-2976** 3 School Street Hardscape 42.3.2/125 Flavin Architects

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Tom Flavin, Flavin Architects
 Public None
 Concerns (8:48) **Flavin** – Asked to continue this so they can follow up on HSAB comments.
 Not opened at this time.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

50. Taylor Murphy **02-2961** 7 Evergreen Way Garage door change 68/722 Self
 Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Taylor Murphy, owner
 Public None
 Concerns (8:49) **Murphy** – Presented project.
Camp – Black is too harsh for a garage door; prefers the natural to weather.
Thornewill – Agrees.
Oliver – She's okay with black.
McLaughlin – Black isn't a good color.
Coombs – Opposed to the garage door going to black.
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

Following items continued to February 25, 2021, 1:00 p.m.

51. 37 Pocomo Road R.T. **02-2932** 37 Pocomo Road New dwelling 14/38 Workshop/APD
 52. Brian Rice **02-2965** 41 Crooked Lane Main house addition 41/202 Workshop/APD
 53. Brian Rice **02-2964** 41 Crooked Lane Garage addition 41/202 Workshop/APD
 54. Julia Killian **02-2938** 10 Mayhew Lane Pool and hardscape 41/443 Julie Jordin
 55. 5 Yawkey Way Trst **02-2950** 5 Yawkey Way New duplex building 69/299 Val Oliver Design
 56. Richard Phillips Trust **02-2978** 19 East Tristram Avenue Rev. 09-1862: ext. alterations 31/4.1 Botticelli + Pohl
 57. Stuart Hendrin **02-2941** 43 Kendrick Street New dwelling MH 76.4.3/31 CWA
 58. Stuart Hendrin **02-2942** 43 Kendrick Street Garage 76.4.3/31 CWA
 59. Gifford Whitney A Trst **02-2977** 6 Lily Street Renovations 42.3.4/45 CWA
 60. Diedre Hamlin Trust **02-2951** 6 Lowell Place Addition 41/167 Topham Design

V. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	John Bartlett Trust 01-2793	43 Bartlett Farm Road	New dwelling	82/504	NAG
2.	Phillips Marks 01-2706	33 Beach Grass Road	Duplex	68/371	SMRD
3.	33 Coffin St, LLC 01-2747	33 Coffin Street, Sias	Cabana	73.4.1/26.1	CWA
4.	Peter Barrett 01-2734	40 Mary Ann Drive	New dwelling	68/965	Topham Design
5.	80 Millbrook Trust	80 Millbrook Trust	New guest house/cabana	40/79.1	Sophie Metz Design
6.	11 India Street, LLC 01-2816	11 India Street	Hardscaping	42.3.1/122.2	Ahern
7.	17 Avenue RT 01-2776	17 Lincoln Avenue	Rev. 12-2442: ext. revisions	30/118	Botticelli + Pohl
8.	Andrew Reger 12-2469	7 East Lincoln Avenue	New dwelling	42.4.1/8	Emeritus
9.	14 Lowell Place LLC 10-2188	14 Lowell Place	New dwelling	41/164	Emeritus

HDC Minutes for February 23, 2021, adopted Mar. 30

10. Grey Lady Capital 12-2381	33 Pilgrim Road	Cabana addition	41/834	JB Studio
11. Shriberg Trust 01-2796	60 West Chester Street	Guest house	41/374	CWA
12. 36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2813	36 Washing Pond Road	New dwelling	31/13.3	Workshop APD
13. 36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2808	36 Washing Pond Road	New guest house	31/13.3	Workshop APD
14. 36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-1814	36 Washing Pond Road	Garage	31/13.3	Workshop APD
15. 36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2807	36 Washing Pond Road	Gym	31/13.3	Workshop APD
16. 36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2810	36 Washing Pond Road	Shed	31/13.3	Workshop APD
17. 36 Washing Pond, LLC 01-2809	36 Washing Pond Road	Pool	31/13.3	Jardins International

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	January 28 & February 1 & 4 2021
Review Minutes	February 12, 16 & 18, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting- Old Business Thursday 2/25/21 at 01:00 pm. • HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Discussion of 6 Fair Street Minimum Maintenance • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:57 p.m. (McLaughlin)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board