



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, March 26, 2019

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 4:30 p.m.

Called to order at 4:34 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Watterson, Dutra
Absent Members: Oliver
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: Watterson, 5:20 p.m.; Welch, 5:30 p.m. returned 7:21 p.m.; McLaughlin, 8:40 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

- Kuester** – Read letter from Hilary Rayport 89 Main Street asking HDC to convince to halt the proposed work for Upper Main Street. His comments on the same subject is a judge ruled that the HDC has jurisdiction over sidewalks; neighbors are working for own legal opinion. In front of Pacific Club, the sidewalk was raised four courses of brick, so water now runs into the building. Asked for an emergency work order to restore the sidewalk back the way it was.
- Other business moved forward - Letter of concern in regard to proposed addition at 1 North Swift Rock Road.
Pohl – This letter did not get to the HDC until after the approval was made. A lot is not germane to HDC purview. This has to be voted into the record: voting: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Watterson.
Motion to Include the letter for 1 North Swift Rock Road into the file. (Camp) Carried 5-0

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map-Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Hunter, William – 72097	3 Sleetwing Circle	Adding skylight	74-27	NAG
2.	Lerner, Louis – 72098	15 New Lane	Parge chimney	41-282	Concept Design
3.	Nicolin, Magnus – 72099	6 Brier Patch Road	Change chimney material	21-136	NAG
4.	Paine, Robert – 72100	82 Cliff Road	Basement window	30-606	Ethan McMorro
5.	Urban, Keith – 72101	1 Jonathan Way	Color change	75-36	Ethan McMorro
6.	Loeb, Charlie – 72102	25 Pleasant Street	Door color change	55.4.1-111	Elisa Allen
7.	13 Hoick Hollow R.T. – 72103	13 Hoicks Hollow Road	Pergola	48-1.3	Ahern, LLC
8.	Thompson/Jacobi – 72104	15 King Street	Hardscape: brck patio,rail ties	73.4.2-62	Thornewill Design
9.	Kern, Douglas – 72105	71 West Chester Street	Window revisions	41-364	Botticelli & Pohl
10.	Burke, Janice – 72106	36 North Liberty Street	Rev. 70021: ac unit, railing	41-265	Val Oliver
11.	Hawthorne Park, LLC – 72107	43 Hummock Pond Road	Outdoor shower	56-806	Workshop APD
12.	Hawthorne Park, LLC – 72108	51 Hummock Pond Road	Outdoor shower	56-811	Workshop APD
13.	Ruley, Meg – 72109	5 Franklin Street	Main Dwelling – porch	41-391	Val Oliver
14.	Ruley, Meg – 72110	5 Franklin Street	Cottage– porch	41-391	Val Oliver
15.	BeKind Development, LLC – 72111	4 Pilgrim Court	Rev. 70716: cabana	41-217.2	Self
16.	BeKind Development, LLC – 72112	4 Pilgrim Court	Rev. 68201: MH	41-217.2	Self
17.	Comcast – 72113	1 Monomoy Road	Roof change	55-68	Greg Logan
18.	Kopelman, Joshua – 72114	13 Maxey Pond Road	Addition	40-101	JMS Architecture
19.	Moseley, Jenny – 72115	12A Oak Hollow Rd	Garage door color change	56-128.1	Thornewill Design
20.	18 Orange Street, LLC – 72116	18 Orange Street	Color change	42.3.2-15	Emeritus
21.	Gaslight Theatre – 72117	3 North Union Street	Hardscape; pergola/fence	42.3.1-214.2	Edgewater
22.	Crowley, Artell – 72118	6R New Lane	Shed	41-539	Self
23.	Ambrecht, Amy – 72119	13 Giny Lane	New dwelling revisions	41-850	Robert Newman
24.	Ambrecht, Amy – 72120	13 Giny Lane	Garage revisions	41-850	Robert Newman
25.	Caggiano, Paul – 72121	9 North Point	Outdoor shower	38-80	Linda Williams
26.	12 Newtown, LLC – 72122	12 Newtown Road	Remove chimney	55-197	Linda Williams
27.	Andersen, Scott – 72123	282 Madaket Road	Shed	59.4-68	Emeritus
28.	Lynch, Karen – 72124	19 Main Street	Demo/move shed	73.3.1-12	Botticelli & Pohl

29. Lynch, Karen – 72125	19 Main Street	Shed addition	73.3.1-12	Botticelli & Pohl
30. Sanford, Alfred – 72126	36B Lily Street	Rev. 71571: windows	42.4.3-94	Botticelli & Pohl
31. Rankin, Scott – 72127	10 Washington Avenue	Garage door change	60.2.1-2	Ethan McMorrow
32. Seventeen BR Property, LLC – 72128	1 Low Beach Road	Rev. 71791	73.3.2-27	Botticelli & Pohl
33. Seventeen BR Property, LLC – 72129	1 Low Beach Road	Rev. 71201: addition	73.3.2-27	Botticelli & Pohl

Voting Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra

Alternates None

Recused Pohl, Watterson

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**

Vote Carried 4-0//McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # 72097 to 72129

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map-Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	8 Highland Avenue, LLC – 72130	8 Highland Avenue	Pool/hardscape	30-287	Atlantic Lndscp
	• Pool not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter.				
2.	Day, Michael – 72131	3 Crestwood Circle	Rev. 71694: addition/windows	71-39	Rowland & Assoc.
	• Due to lack of visibility.				
3.	Whyte, Aphneil – 72132	14 Nanina Drive	Shed	67-579	Self
	• Doors to be painted Nantucket Blue to match main house.				
4.	Newton, Jeff – 72133	190 Cliff Road	Window/door changes	40-23	M Cutone Arch
	• Due to lack of visibility.				

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra

Alternates Welch, Watterson

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No additional concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff per noted comments. (Camp)**

Vote Carried 4-0//McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # 72130 to 72133

IV. SIGNS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map-Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Comm. Found for Nant.	9B Bayberry Court	Wall sign	55-709.2	Margaret Andrews
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Watterson				
Alternates	Welch, Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	None				
Sign Advisory	Kevin Kuester , Sign Advisory Committee – Recommend held because the sign is on a building side without a door.				
Concerns	None at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate #	

2.	Reinemo, Julie	25 Old South Road	Sign	68.1-25	Bob Ramos
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Watterson				
Alternates	Welch, Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	None				
Sign Advisory	Kevin Kuester , Sign Advisory Committee – Recommend approvable per SAC comments.				
Concerns	No additional concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per SAC comments. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate # 72134	

3.	N.I.R. – 72135	44 Straight Wharf	Projecting Sign	42.2.4-15	Nathan McMullen
4.	N.I.R. – 72136	19 Old South Wharf	Projecting sign	42.2.4-2	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Watterson				
Alternates	Welch, Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	None				
Sign Advisory	Kevin Kuester , Sign Advisory Committee – Recommend bot be approved, no conditions.				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve both. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72135 and 72136	

V. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map-Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	25A Pine Street, LLC	25A Pine Street	Renovations	42.3.2-112	McMullen&Assoc.
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Welch, Watterson				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen , McMullen & Associates – He thinks the 7/12 roof should be celebrated; reviewed changes made per previous concerns. A center issue for the owner is to keep the door centered.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:55)	<p>Coombs – Read HSAB comments: not appropriate; highly stylized and too much brick.</p> <p>Watterson – He thought there was the suggestion for a 4-bay front façade; suggested moving the door off center and remove a window on the second floor. The 5 bay is very busy.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees a 4 bay with offset door is appropriate. The box cornice is too stylized; a simple rake detail would be more appropriate. Should be wood shutters throughout as opposed to match existing. The issue is the mixed 3-4 bay, which is an inappropriate design; we’ve made suggestions how to address that. With respect to a staff approval, he wants to see this again first. He believes it is inappropriate for this structure to have that many windows on the front with shutters.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates the size of the windows on the front façade. Agrees about the 4-bay being more appropriate.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Watterson)				
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #		
2.	25A Pine Street, LLC	25A Pine Street	Hardscape	42.3.2-112	McMullen&Assoc.
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra				
Alternates	Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, March 12 minutes, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Nathan McMullen , McMullen & Associates – Reviewed project and changes made per previous concerns. Any changes to the front façade will impact the entry landing and parking.				
Public	None				
Concerns (time)	<p>Coombs – Read HSAB comments: too many bricks.</p> <p>Camp – Even though the brick is existing, there is too much hardscaping in front of the building; Would prefer the middle section be green or a mix of a softer material.</p> <p>Dutra – Agrees there is a lot of hardscape in front; breaking up the material would help; suggested a 2-foot garden bed in front of the front brick landing.</p> <p>Welch – Nothing has changed since the last meeting; read his comments from March 12; they still stand. He would add that this might be existing, but it is currently in front of a 1st-floor garage space, not a residence. He’d like detailed drawing of the fence and where it’s going - there are a variety of fences in play - the brick around the structure, which in part is going over a timber dry partition; there is nothing in the application that the timber dry partition is being altered; it also goes over a concrete retaining wall that needs to be reconciled; and the brick is shown going to the abutter’s yard. He might have concerns about the amount of brick walkway on the southside.</p> <p>Coombs – The little raised bricks step would lend itself to having a little green sward in front of it to separate the entry from the parking. Would like the fence to match and follow the neighbor’s fence.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Dutra)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		

3.	205 EP Trust	205 Eel Point Road	Rev. 69278: cabana	38-31	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind</i> .				
Representing	Michael Luft-Weissberg , Workshop APD – Reviewed the project and changes made per previous concerns.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:55)	<p>Pohl – The north elevation previously had three equally-spaced doors; now it has a stand-alone door as well.</p> <p>Camp – She’s okay with it.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North and the west sides exceed the 50% fenestration guidelines.</p> <p>Welch – The bubbling of the north and east should accurately reflect changes. Preferred the chimney; he believes the north is visible but only obliquely.</p> <p>Pohl – He’s okay with leaving the south elevation as approved. Everyone regrets the loss of the chimney. No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	72137	

VI. NEW BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map-Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Cohen, Steven L. Trustee	7 Hinkley Lane	Rev. 70479: new dwelling	30-170.1	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Michael Luft-Weissberg , Workshop APD – Presented project; the south elevation is pushed into the hillside.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:29)	<p>McLaughlin – Suggested a view.</p> <p>Camp – Wants to view.</p> <p>Coombs – South elevation, the triple ganged windows should be separated; they are insufficient as proposed; the No. 101 window on Mass 1 is too small. This house could support larger windows. The gable windows should remain, and the overall fenestration needs more attention.</p> <p>Dutra – He would prefer the stone chimney, but this is probably more appropriate; he’s not crazy about the white clapboard and trim. The windows won’t be visible.</p> <p>Pohl – The open rectangle under the chimney cap is where the mushroom-thing for the gas-log fireplace goes. With the new clapboard in place of the stone gable ends, he is opposed to it and the trim being white, at least until it’s in place. This is a good opportunity to review the project.</p> <p>Staff – You can see the top of the framed gables from Kimball Avenue.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		
2.	Cohen, Steven L. Trustee	7 Hinkley Lane	Rev. 70480: new 2 nd dwelling	30-170.1	Workshop APD
3.	Cohen, Steven L. Trustee	7 Hinkley Lane	Rev. 70481: garage	30-170.1	Workshop APD
4.	Cohen, Steven L. Trustee	7 Hinkley Lane	Rev. 70482: studio	30-170.1	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Michael Luft-Weissberg, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:29)	No comments at this time.				
Motion	Motion to View and to track. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried		Certificate #		

5.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC	9 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling Type C	66-709	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Michael Luft-Weissberg , Workshop APD – Presented project; Quaker grey.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:47)	<p>Camp – This is a nice design. She’s okay with the way dwellings A, B, & C relate.</p> <p>Coombs – Thinks this is will fairly hard to see. This is not inappropriate but doesn’t like the long dormer roofs.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This is highly visible. North elevation, the sidelights are not typical; the “G” window should be double hung to match the rest.</p> <p>Dutra – Agrees with much that’s been said. It’s a nice, balanced design.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees with the board. Change the “G” window on the north elevation. The bottom glass panel of the sidelights should be a wood panel.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation “G” window to be double hung and the bottom third of the sidelights to be a solid wood panel and the dormer roof pitch to be reduced to 7/12. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72138	
6.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC	11 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling Type B	66-710	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Michael Luft-Weissberg , Workshop APD – Presented project; Quaker grey trim and black sash.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:03)	<p>Camp – Suggested approving with the same condition for the pitch of the dormer roofs.</p> <p>Coombs – The hardscaping will be important in separating the lots. Agrees about the dormer pitch change. No further concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the dormer roof pitch reduced to 7/12. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72139	
7.	Hawthorne Park Prtnrs	2A Hawthorne Lane	Rev. 69554: chimney cap	56-808	Workshop APD
8.	Hawthorne Park Prtnrs	4A Hawthorne Lane	Rev. 67910: chimney cap	56-806	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Michael Luft-Weissberg , Workshop APD – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (time)	<p>Coombs – The pitch of the view of the screen would make it look more solid.</p> <p>McLaughlin – If it weren’t power driven, something else could be.</p> <p>Camp – Asked for a view.</p> <p>Dutra – Questions the purpose of the cap if it’s opened on top.</p> <p>Pohl – This isn’t a traditional treatment, but it will be happening more and more; would like some sort of mesh screen to hide the fan. The photos were taken from a public way; there is visibility. Suggested a screen in a wood frame popped in for a view.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View both Items 7 & 8. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		

9.	Lee, Jeff	9 Aurora Way	Addition/ deck	56-450	Design Associates
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Dutra				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Chris Dallmus , Design Associates – Presented project; skylight is over the kitchen island.				
Public	Jesse Dutra , 76 Hummock Pond Road – The “road” on the west property line is my driveway; it is not a public way.				
Concerns (6:19)	Coombs – The air-conditioner (A/C) condenser units will be visible looking along the west elevation. The east elevation gable 3-over-3 window is too square; needs to be more vertical. South elevation, the skylight as drawn looks wrong and should go on the upper part of the roof. McLaughlin – This is visible from all four sides. West elevation, the addition gable pitch should be at a minimum 7/12. The casement windows should be fixed. West elevation, the triple-ganged “E” windows are casement; should be double-hung or fixed. Pohl – The skylight is appropriately sized; doesn’t think it will be visible. He likes the lower pitch on the back addition gable and it won’t be visible.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the “C” casement windows to be fixed; the A/C is to be screened from view at time of inspection and thereafter; and revise the drawings to show the south elevation “E” windows to be double hung. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	72140	
10.	Bowman, Jennifer	14 Starbuck Road	Shed	60-114	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Katie Mitchell , for Ethan McMorrow – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:39)	Pohl – Read MAB comments: if shed is moved back, it will become more visible. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the screening to remain in place. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72141	
11.	19-21 Starbuck Road, LLC	19 Starbuck Road	Rev. 68043: windows	60-109	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Katie Mitchell , for Ethan McMorrow – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:29)	Pohl – Read MAB comments: photos show 8-over-1s; as-built fee should be paid. The narrow windows are still 6-over-1. Camp – It’s unfortunate but she has no concerns. A penalty should be paid; there are nine windows changed. Dutra – Agrees with Ms. Camp. Coombs – They should all be 8-over-1 or 6-over-1, not a mix. The question is whether or not to fine them. McLaughlin – The windows are mixed and matched; suggests all the 8-over-1 on first floor and 6-over-1 on the second floor and all “F” windows to be fixed. Pohl – With Andersen, windows of a certain size will have a pre-set mullion pattern; you have no choice. Because the windows are black with black screens, the mullion pattern isn’t discernable. We’ve been inconsistent about the fine; there is no sign-off on this as yet, so this is an “open” permit.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the 9 windows to be allowed as 8-over-1 and no fee to be paid. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin opposed		Certificate #	72142	
12.	19-21 Starbuck Road, LLC	19 Starbuck Road	Rev. 68359: fenst, shwr, & A/C	60-109	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Katie Mitchell , for Ethan McMorrow – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (7:02)	Pohl – Read MAB comments: same concerns. The east elevation is messed up.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for corrected drawings. (Dutra)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		

Break 7:07 to 7:13 p.m.

13. Aloha Nominee Trust	91 Low Beach Road	Rev. 71798: add copper gutters	75-31	Gryphon Arch.
Voting	Coombs (acting chair, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra)			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Ethan Griffin , Gryphon Architects – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:14)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0	Certificate #	72143	
14. Pierpont	1 Mackay Way	Color change	42.4.1-62.1	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:19)	<p>Pohl – Read HSAB comments: prefer trim as is.</p> <p>McLaughlin – White is an approved color and there’s plenty of it in that area.</p> <p>Camp – The grey trim with red sashes used to be everywhere. Asked the age of the house.</p> <p>Dutra – No concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – Would also like to know the age.</p> <p>Staff – Circa 1960.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp abstain	Certificate #	72144	
15. Fraker, Ford	12 Mt. Vernon	Studio	55.4.4-35	Permits Plus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Mark Poor , Permits Plus – Presented project; suggested a view because this is not visible; he’ll put up 22-foot height poles.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:24)	<p>Pohl – Read HSAB comments: 2-story inappropriate; better pane size similar to “A” windows.</p> <p>Camp – She thinks this is way too tall and competes with the main house; the existing is appropriate is size. Suggested a view.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees it is out of proportion and too tall.</p>			
Motion	Motion to View. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		
16. Kozera, James	14 Mizzenmast Road	Fence	66-372	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	James Kozera , owner – Presented project; decided to go with 5&1.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:29)	Coombs – This is not going to be visible. Lattice should be square.			
	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted with the lattice to be horizontal-vertical. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72145	

17. Gazaille, Mark	10 Doc Ryder Drive	Roof top solar	66-217	Matt Parent
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Mark Gazaille , owner – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:34)	Dutra – He doesn't think it will be visible; the panels face the neighbor's driveway. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp abstain	Certificate #	72146	
18. N.I.R. Retail, LLC	38 Main Street	Color change	42-190	Jamie Lee Nass
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:39)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		
19. 16 Winn Street, LLC	16 Winn Street	Dormer revisions	56-205	M. Cutone Arch.
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Mark Cutone , Mark Cutone Architecture – Presented project; as far as he knows, there is no big tree.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:39)	Coombs – There was a big tree to the rear of the property that was given to the Town and is protected; wants to know what happened to it. Okay with the change. Camp – The drawings look worse than reality. McLaughlin – It's typical. Dutra – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72147	
20. 2 Morgan, LLC	2A Morgan Square	Rev. 71866: gables, roof walk	87-3.2	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:46)	Welch – The roof walk is a little long; okay with it reduced. Coombs – It should be 12X8. She doesn't think the skirt is necessary. McLaughlin – It's not appropriate on a 1.5 story house. Camp – Agrees with reducing it. Pohl – It's natural to weather and will be reduced to 12 feet; he's okay.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the roof walk natural to weather to be reduced 12x8 feet and due to its remote location. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72148	

21. Bluefin, LLC	6 Ellen's Way	New dwelling	81-172	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project; cobblestone trim and black sash and doors.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:52)	<p>Coombs – This won't be visible from the rear.</p> <p>Camp – The railing should be baluster or shingled; not cabled.</p> <p>Dutra – Prefer baluster rails.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Cable rail is inappropriate.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the cable railing to be baluster or shingled wall. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72149
22. Bluefin, LLC	6 Ellen's Way	Studio/garage	81-172	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (7:59)	Same concerns about the cable rail.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the cable railing to be baluster or shingled wall to match the main house. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72150
23. Bluefin, LLC	6 Ellen's Way	Pool	81-172	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:00)	<p>Camp – The fence is the only screening provided; that's not adequate. Wants something to mitigate the visibility of the fence.</p> <p>Dutra – Move the fence with the vegetation on the driveway side.</p> <p>Coombs – When they cut the road in, they clear-cut the area; what's growing back is very small. Agrees with Ms. Camp.</p> <p>McLaughlin – There is no gate to reach the pool; the fence is solid up to the house wall.</p> <p>Pohl - We need to follow protocol: allow the commissioners to express concerns, then the applicant can respond. He is also in favor of vegetating in front of the 48-inch board fence facing the road.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with vegetation between the drive-parking and the fence; a solid fence onto the porch; and the pool not to be visible in perpetuity. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-1//Camp opposed		Certificate #	72151

HDC Minutes March 26, 2019, adopted Apr. 23

24. Strong Wings, Inc. – 72152	9 Nobadeer Farm Road	New fence	69-88	Botticelli & Pohl
25. Strong Wings, Inc. – 72153	11 Nobadeer Farm Road	New fence	69-88	Botticelli & Pohl
26. Strong Wings, Inc. – 72154	13 Nobadeer Farm Road	New fence	69-88	Botticelli & Pohl
27. Strong Wings, Inc. – 72155	15 Nobadeer Farm Road	New fence	69-88	Botticelli & Pohl
28. Strong Wings, Inc. – 72156	17 Nobadeer Farm Road	New fence	69-88	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project; Ben Champoux has a planting plan for along the foundation of the fence.			
Public	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl			
Concerns (8:10)	<p>Dutra – Appreciates the throw-back to the Morgan fence. On the cap detail, asked if that is a historic cap; he was thinking more of a plain on top. He'd prefer the fence be natural to weather.</p> <p>Camp – Asked why the two turn backs at the left entry don't match the ones on the right. Agrees with Mr. Dutra about leaving it natural to weather; she has to repaint her fence every year. Agrees about squaring off the top instead of a cap.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No concerns.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Mr. Dutra about painting and the caps. There is significant vegetation along this road; we've been saying that every third or fourth section should have vegetation to break up the line of fence, but this has very thick vegetation; except on the "yard" portions where some plantings would help.</p> <p>Coombs – It will be a good thing to have and the fence is fun and different.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the fence to be natural to weather, a not-beveled post cap, and plantings along the fence foundation. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72152 to 72156	
29. Winer, Elizabeth	34 Cliff Road	New porch	42.4.4-47	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:23)	<p>Coombs – Read HSAB comments: east elevation porch good addition; south elevation, 2nd-floor deck should be pulled in 4 feet to align with columns below; west elevation pulled in 2nd-floor deck 2 feet.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with HSAB about pulling in the east elevation 2nd-floor deck, at least by 1 foot.</p> <p>Dutra – Okay with the south elevation porch. Agrees with Mr. Welch on the east elevation.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with east elevation 2nd-floor deck pulled in 1 foot. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72157	
30. Ceylon Elves, LLC	3 Wyers Way- Lot A	Demo/move dwelling	41-380	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project, circa 1969.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:28)	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move or demolition. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72158	
31. Ceylon Elves, LLC	3 Wyers Way- Lot A	Demo/move garage	41-380	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:28)	Camp – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move or demolition. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72159	

32. Ceylon Elves, LLC	3 Wyers Way- Lot A	New dwelling	41-380	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:31)	<p>McLaughlin – The “E” windows, if visible, should be fixed. Skylights should be moved to the back. The front door should be a standard 6-panel door or solid wood. This design is appropriate for the neighborhood.</p> <p>Camp – West elevation right, would like the eave height dropped a little to make it more subordinate; it also looks pinched and the porch could be a little deeper; rather than a skylight would prefer a small dormer.</p> <p>Dutra – Agrees with Ms. Camp; 5’6” would be a nice porch size. North elevation the 1st-floor “E” window should move away from the corner.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with what’s been said. East and west elevations, the “C3” windows in the shed dormer seem out of proportion. The 12-light front door might look better with a thinner 9-light window to echo the sunporch fenestration.</p> <p>Coombs – She’d like to see a front door with 4 panels and 4 lights</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	
33. Ceylon Elves, LLC	3 Wyers Way- Lot A	New garage	41-380	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:41)	No comments at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold to track. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
34. Colson, Nancy	9 Hallowell Lane	Rev. 70517: deck, etc	30-14	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Pohl			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:46)	<p>Welch – The deck railing facing the water is an issue; suggested another vertical and horizontal around the cross.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with Mr. Welch about breaking up the spider web. Skylights should be moved.</p> <p>Dutra – No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for minor revisions. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
35. August Point, LLC	8 Willard Street	Hardscape; fence	42.4.1-55.1	Wingworks
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Tidal Henry , Wingworks – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:46)	<p>Pohl – Read HSAB comments: concerns about height.</p> <p>Welch – Would like to know the style of the house in respect to the type of fence proposed. Okay with the 5&1 extension and the “living” fence; however, the green fence should be no more than 6 feet only if it is shrouded with plants.</p> <p>Coombs – A 7-foot fence is way too high.</p> <p>Dutra – Agrees 6 feet is sufficient.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the green fence to be no taller than 6 feet and the lattice on the 5&1 to be vertical-horizontal. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72160

36. Halik, Robin	46 Surfside Road	New garage/duplex	67-120.3+773	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Carrie Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:49)	<p>Welch – With respect to massing, this is way too big for that lot as compared to other structures in the area this close to the road; the existing home on the lot is 1-story w/hip roof, the Muse (next door) is 1-story; the 2nd-story gable proposed is proud to the street upstaging the existing, there is no additive massing.</p> <p>Coombs – There are a bunch of 1-story houses in that area; she doesn't think this is the place to start 2-story commercial development.</p> <p>Dutra – It's tight and big; but he understands the need. He feels this is a proper area for commercial, but it takes away from the existing building and the yard and should be moved away. The front should look like the front of a house.</p> <p>Camp – A reduction in house and length would help; she doesn't want to overpower the existing structure. Agrees with what's been said. She wants to drive by and visualize the scale.</p> <p>Pohl – It lacks a sense of entry on the street. If the front portion were brought down to 1.5 stories, that would mask what's happening in back and relate better to the 1-story structures either side of it.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried		Certificate #	
37. Malone, Barb	6 Hiwassee Lane	Rev 71847	56-471	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (8:42)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	
38. Carter, Jeff	10 ½ Cherry Street	New dwelling	55-383.2	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Jessie Brescher , Glidden & Glidden – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (9:00)	<p>Pohl – Read HSAB comments: North elevation dormer too big; craftsman style door inappropriate; south elevation lower gable eave height; all windows 6-over-6.</p> <p>Welch – Many structures here are simplified Cape Cod cottage; this particular frontage could be made to represent easily. On the other hand, it is quite far from the road. He will drive by and look at it.</p> <p>Coombs – East elevation right side, the ganged windows should be separated and a little larger. Doesn't like the pediment over the front door; it should be eliminated or be a straight roof.</p> <p>Dutra – Agrees with HSAB comments; the 6-over-6 would make it more colonial. The North elevation left shed roof pitch should drop to 5/12. Suggested a fun color for the front door, anything other than white. The dormers seem over fenestrated but doesn't agree that they are over fenestrated.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with HSAB that the dormers are too heavy; all windows should get wider. Doesn't mind the columns at the front door but the pediment is too much. Agrees about the steep shed roof pitch on the left. Agrees about separating the two east elevation windows.</p> <p>Pohl – Agrees with what's been said. The front and side doors shouldn't be same style and aren't cottage doors.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	

39. Carter, Jeff	10 ½ Cherry Street	Studio	55-383.2	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Jessie Brescher , Glidden & Glidden – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (9:14)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: north elevation window too close to door. Camp – Agrees with HSAB. Welch – He agrees and would also put a cap on the north elevation window. Coombs – Agrees with HSAB and Mr. Welch. Dutra – Agrees.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for a very minor revision. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	

40. Maley Rugged, LLC	18 Bayberry Lane	New dwelling	67-67	Val Oliver
41. Staudt, Chris	6 Morey Lane	Modify driveway, fence	73.3.1-46.2	Cashion CPM
42. Peterson, Richard	6 King Street	Mini-splits	73.1.3-86	Cashion CPM
43. Peterson, Richard	6 King Street	Mini-splits	73.1.3-86	Cashion CPM
44. Black, Darren	28 Eel Point Road	Rev 71646; window/dormer	40-44	Emeritus
45. Fee, Matthew	6 Rugged Road	Roof top solar- tertiary dwelling	67-784	ACK Smart
46. Maraganore	41 Ocean Avenue	Expand deck	73.3.2-50	Mark Avery
47. Kelly, Bruce	11 Baxter Road	Roof chng	73.1.4-8	Will Stephens
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (9:19)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold Items 40-47 for Thursday, May 28 at 1 p.m. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	

VII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	March 12, 2019
Review Minutes	March 14 & 19, 2019
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion of update on Vineyard Wind project. • Discussion of public information session on upper Main Street sidewalk and road work. Coombs – Wants to ensure the Upper Main Street issue is discussed Thursday or Tuesday at least. Staff – The informational meeting last Thursday was videotaped. • Letter of concern in regard to proposed addition at 1 North Swift Rock Road. See Public Comments. • Discussion of drafting a letter to the Select Board in regard to upper Main Street sidewalk and road work. • Discussion and possible vote to expand Historic Structures Advisory Board map for review of applications. • Discussion of approvable roof shingle colors, roof color change applications being placed on the Consent agenda and posting approved colors on the Town website. • Discussion of potential work at the airport and section 106.
Commission Comments	None

- List of additional documents used at the meeting:
1. Letter from Hilary Rayport of 89 Main Street

Adjourned at 9:20 p.m. by unanimous consent

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board Madaket Advisory Board Sign Advisory Committee