



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Monday, May 4, 2020

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 4:32 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Watterson, Dutra
Absent Members: None
Late Arrivals: Dutra, 5:51 p.m.
Early Departures: McLaughlin, 8:05 p.m.
NCTV: Andrew Cromartie, Director

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Anthony Barila 05-0889	11 Luff Road	480 sf garage	66-354	Permits Plus
2.	Allen Cohen 05-0887	41 Pocomo Road	Roof change	15-20.1	Barry Donovan
3.	Christian Darby 05-0890	73 Baxter Road	Rev. 58315: window chg	49-27	Permits Plus
4.	Reggie Bradford 05-0884	11 Hickory Meadow Lane	Color change - MH	41-903	Botticelli & Pohl
5.	Reggie Bradford 05-0886	11 Hickory Meadow Lane	Color change - Garage	41-903	Botticelli & Pohl
6.	Reggie Bradford 05-0885	11 Hickory Meadow Lane	Color change - Cabana	41-903	Botticelli & Pohl
7.	Donald Ryder 05-0882	6 Dennis Drive	Roof change	67-359	Steven Phillip
8.	Chris O'Reilly (TBD)	17A Bartlett Road	Fence	67-9.2	Linda Williams
9.	Stephanie Silva 05-0883	6 Bayberry Lane	Roof change	67-73	Self
10.	G&S, LLC 05-0888	81 Vestal Street	Garage revisions	56-254	Mark Cutone Architecture
11.	TPG Hotels & Rsrt 03-0849	20 North Water Street	Egress staircase change	42.4.2-46	Ethan McMorro

Voting Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Watterson

Alternates Welch

Recused Pohl

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve the consent items. (Camp)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//McLaughlin-aye, Oliver-aye, Watterson-aye, Camp-aye, Certificate # **HDC2020-05-(as noted)**
Coombs-aye

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Erik Knutzen (TBD) • Due to lack of visibility	21 Lyons Lane	Rev. 02-0677: stairs	71-12	Ethan McMorrow
2. Nikki Martin (TBD) • Due to lack of visibility	20 Bartlett Road	Addition; A/C; otdr shwr	67-594	Permits Plus
3. NISDA 05-0901 • Updated site plan to be submitted	23 Wauwinet Road	Driveway/apron	20-36	Bracken Engineering
4. Seventh Fen N.T. 05-0894 • Due to lack of visibility	250 Madaket Road	Addition	59.4-213	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve per noted conditions. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp-aye, Oliver-aye, Coombs-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-05-(as noted)

IV. OLD BUSINESS FROM CARRIED OVER FROM 3/17/20

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Century House R.E. 02-0617	10B Cliff Road	Color change	42.4.4-61	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch			
Alternates				
Recused	Watterson			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public				
Concerns (4:45)	<p>Pohl – Reviewed prior hearings: Mr. Welch had requested a rendering of colors; Ms. Camp had noted most structures in the neighborhood have white trim.</p> <p>MacEachern – Moccasin is a beige color for the clapboard with grey trim; if it is still a concern, he can omit it and keep the existing color.</p> <p>Coombs – She’d prefer the trim stay white but would be okay with very light grey.</p> <p>Camp – Likes it the way it is. Okay with the deck lattice being Quaker grey. The porch railings and columns should remain white.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Ms. Camp. Everything except the moccasin is appropriate; if it is used, he’d want to see a rendering.</p> <p>Pohl – The majority of members prefer white trim.</p> <p>MacEachern – Applicant is okay with eliminating the moccasin and keeping the clapboard its current color. Asked this be held to discuss with the owner.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0// Camp-aye, Coombs-aye, Welch-aye, Pohl-aye		Certificate #	
2. 12 Lincoln NT 02-0692	12 Lincoln Avenue	Rev. 02-0622: windows	30-183	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Watterson			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:06)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns: front façade window is going to true divided light (TDL), the other 22 windows will be simulated-divided light (SDL).</p> <p>No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//McLaughlin-aye, Oliver-aye, Camp-aye, Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0692

3. Prickly Pear Trust 03-0845	17 Broadway	Window alt and dormers	73.1.3-112	Val Oliver
Voting	Welch (acting chair), McLaughlin, Dutra			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, <i>'Sconset House by House, Houses of 'Sconset</i> , historical documentation, and video demonstration.			
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:52)	<p>Oliver – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; presented the bi-fold windows.</p> <p>Backus – HSAB had said all the dormers on top of dormers were inappropriate; proposed north dormer okay if meets guidelines. Reviewed Nantucket Preservation Trust (NPT) historical photo dated 1910.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Clarified the application and the bi-fold windows for the in-fill porch.</p> <p>Dutra – East elevation 2nd floor, doesn't see the need for the swing windows there as well; due to the historical significance, double-hung windows on the 2nd floor would be better. Likes the bi-fold windows which look like double-hung windows.</p> <p>Welch – East elevation, the introduction of the bi-fold TDL window is okay but the 2nd floor should be double-hung. Okay with the north end dormer. South elevation, mulled units of the new type is appropriate with double-hung on the 2nd floor.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the 1st floor as proposed and 2nd-floor to be double hung all TDL and east elevation dormer as submitted. (Dutra)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 2-1//McLaughlin-nay, Dutra-aye, Welch-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-03-0845

V. NEW BUSINESS

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Donald Torey 03-0868	63 West Chester Street	Fence/gate/arbor	41-222.2	Dennis Galvin
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Dennis Galvin, Nantucket Fences				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:17)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Held for representation.				
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #		
2.	N.I.R. 05-0892	2 Straight Wharf	New awning	42.3.1-135	Concept Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	Watterson				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	TJ Watterson, Concept Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:21)	<p>Watterson – Presented project. Admiral blue is a color used by Vineyard Vines. He doubts the canvass awning will stay up through the winter. The awning cheeks will be covered with fabric.</p> <p>Coombs – No concerns. She questions if this is a good location for delivery.</p> <p>Oliver – Asked if the “Admiral” blue ties into other colors on the store and if the awning is retractable. Her concern is setting a precedent of an awning on the street-side of the building. Okay as long as it is seasonal.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Clarified the application.</p> <p>Camp – No concerns.</p> <p>Pohl – This has a metal framework that would remain through the winter after the canvass awning comes off. Doesn't believe the awning will impact traffic.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff abbreviated to 24 feet. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0// Oliver-aye, Camp-aye, Coombs-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-05-0892	

3. Mary Semjen **05-0902** 39 Pilgrim Road Addition 30-74.3 NAG

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates Welch, Watterson
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group (via phone)
 Public None
 Concerns (6:24) (5:34 & 6:13) Held for Mr. Theroux
Theroux – Presented project; east elevation is not visible from Cliff Road or Pilgrim Road. West elevation, suggested making the center of the triple element a more formal 4-light door; that is two fixed doors flanking a working door.
Oliver – Agrees with Mr. Theroux about the visibility of the east elevation. West elevation, by connecting the garage to the main house, there is no longer a front door in the main body of the house; this needs a proper front door. Okay with the massing.
Camp – Confirmed that the wire balustrades won't be visible. She's okay with the triple element being the front door.
McLaughlin – We had issues in the past with horizontal balustrades, and the porch looks more than 8 feet deep. Feels more information is needed to support lack of visibility.
Coombs – Doesn't think it will be visible; thinks it will be okay.
Pohl – It would be helpful to have the revisions bubbled, especially given this current meeting format. No concerns due to lack of visibility.

Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the west elevation center door of the triple element to be a cottage-style, 6-light door. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Oliver-aye, Camp-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-05-0902**

4. Tomburine Prop. LLC **05-0900** 2 South Beach Street Rev. 73265: ramp and door 42.4.2-60 Normand Residential

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates Welch, Watterson, Dutra
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Ben Normand, Residential Design
 Public None
 Concerns (5:37) **Normand** – Presented project: Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliant ramp and door.
Backus – Read her comments: circa 1837, no significant concerns, curious on visibility from Whaler's Lane, photos of existing not included.
Oliver – No concerns as long as it matches existing.
Camp & Coombs – Agree with Ms. Oliver.
McLaughlin – Can't see the plans on his computer screen.

Motion **Motion to Approve.**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//McLaughlin-abstain, Coombs-aye, Camp-aye, Oliver-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-05-0900**

5. Richmond Grt Pt Prop (**TBD**) 63 Old South Road Kitchen hood fan 68-157.2 Self

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates Welch, Watterson, Dutra
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Mayra Escobar, Richmond Great Point Property
 Public None
 Concerns (6:15) **Oliver** – This is an incomplete application: no site plan to indicate which building and fan isn't shown on the elevation. Consensus agrees in the need for a site plan showing and an elevation showing the hood fan to scale.
Flynn – She can call the office for a complete explanation of what is needed.

Motion **Motion to Hold for further information. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver-aye, Camp-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Coombs-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate #

6. Jason Reardon **05-0897** 8 Daffodil Lane Solar roof top 68-771.1 ACK Smart

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Watterson
 Alternates Welch, Dutra
 Recused Camp – Stepped out
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and manufacturer spec sheet.
 Representing Tobias Glidden, ACK Smart
 Public None
 Concerns (6:40) **Glidden** – Presented project: black on black.
McLaughlin – Confirmed no part of the array is silver.
Coombs – The panels ACK Smart uses do not have any silver on them. It’s a long way from Evergreen; visibility will be minimal.
Watterson – This is appropriate on account of limited visibility and screening from a publicly traveled way.
Oliver – No concerns; it meets the criteria. Okay with them all not going the same way since that is on the rear.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Coombs)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0// Coombs-aye, Watterson-aye, Oliver-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-05-0897**

7. Hulbert ACK 11, LLC **05-0898** 4 Hulbert Avenue Window/door chg – GH 42.1.4-2 Sophie Metz

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Watterson
 Alternates Welch, Dutra
 Recused Camp still out
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Sophie Metz, Sophie Metz Design
 Public None
 Concerns (6:49) **Metz** – Presented project: replacing vinyl windows with wood. The air conditioners (A/C) already exist on the south elevation.
Coombs – No concerns; glad to see wood instead of vinyl windows.
Oliver – Had some concern with the mulled windows with shutters but that is existing.
Watterson – No concerns.
McLaughlin – Fine design.
Backus – Saw nothing wrong with window and door changes and removal of the skylight; some concern with the ganged windows on the north and south being too much fenestration.

Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver-aye, Watterson-aye, Coombs-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-05-0989**

8. Hilary Coniff **05-0899** 37 York Street Replc wood fndtn w prge 55.4.1-104 Robert Newman

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch
 Alternates Watterson, Dutra
 Recused Oliver stepped out
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction, Inc.
 Public None
 Concerns (6:59) **Newman** – Presented project; excavate along west edge of foundation with no lifting of the structure.
Backus – Circa 1930s bungalow renovated in 1990s.
Camp – In favor of the project.
Welch – No concerns but wants to ensure the top floor is benchmarked due to proximity to the street.
Coombs – No concerns.
McLaughlin – Clarified where the work is taking place.

Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0// Camp-aye, Welch-aye, Coombs-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-05-0899**

HDC Minutes for May 4, 2020, adopted May 19

9.	Hawthorne Park Prt 03-0828	8B Hawthorne Lane	New dwelling	56-801	Workshop APD
10.	Cannonbury Ln Hld 05-0893	2 Westerwick Drive	Rev. 71711: pool/hardscape	73-311	Ahern LLC
11.	Cannonbury Ln Hld 05-0896	42 Cannonbury Lane	Hardscape-fence/gate/drivy	73-29	Ahern LLC
12.	Cannonbury Ln Hld 05-0895	42 Cannonbury Lane	Boardwalk at grade	73-79	Ahern LLC

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch
 Alternates Watterson, Dutra
 Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns (time) **Flynn** – Ms. Ahern asked Items 9-12 be held and heard together.
 Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold at applicants' requests. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0// Camp-aye, Welch-aye, Coombs-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate #

13.	8 Hulbert Ave, LLC 05-0904	8 Hulbert Avenue	Rev. 12-0262: lift house	29.2.3-7.2	M. Cutone Architecture
-----	-----------------------------------	------------------	--------------------------	------------	------------------------

Voting Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates Welch, Watterson, Dutra
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.
 Representing Doug Mills, Mark Cutone Architecture
 Public None

Concerns (7:14) **Mills** – Presented project: lift 1 additional foot to meet FEMA code. South elevation backs onto the wetland; the new house next door was approved as tall as this will be.
Backus – Circa 1995, visibility of the red cedar vertical board should be considered. This is a contemporary house, but the Department of the Interior has developed alternatives for historic structures and those alternatives will be topics of discussion with the Town consultant. Reviewed options that allow floodwaters to penetrate and flow through.
Camp – No concerns. To Ms. Coombs point, could call for a view. Suggested adding a course of shingle with a water table to mitigate the height of the vertical boards.
Coombs – Confirmed the current height of the house at 28'2" and going to 32'5". This is right on the edge of the wetlands and it will be too tall on the wetlands; doesn't know how the height would come down. It's important to understand the ramification of putting a house this size in such proximity to wetlands.
McLaughlin – This will exceed the 30-foot height guidelines. Plans don't show A/C, which will have to be elevated also.
Oliver – We need to address lifting houses sooner rather than later; one suggestion was to terrace the landscape. Suggested bringing the shingles down farther; likes the v-groove being spaced. Would like additional plantings. She'd like surveyor certification confirming the need to raise the first floor to the proposed height. Asked if there is a material that could be used as a floor system that would not have to be 1 foot above the flood level.
Welch – In the past, we discussed that the v-grove being square cut and having gaps between the boards.
Pohl – Ms. Backus has been working on the impact of rising sea waters on structures in the flood plain. We are currently handling this piecemeal but will have to address it more concertedly. Agrees with Mr. Welch that the v-groove be square cut and spaced. Conservation Commission opposes any terracing within the flood plain; this structure is subject to Conservation Commission review.

Motion **Camp** – Suggested holding a discussion about mitigation for the end of the meeting.
Motion to Approve through staff with the height of the vertical boards mitigated and separated. (Oliver)
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//liver-aye, Coombs-aye, Camp-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-05-0904**

14. Richard Holt **05-0891** 121 Madaket Road Rev. 72983: roofwalk/wind 40-60.1 Botticelli & Pohl

Voting Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Watterson
 Alternates Welch, Dutra
 Recused Pohl
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.
 Representing Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl
 Public None
 Concerns (7:47)

Botticelli – Presented project. Feels the view from Cliff Road is a long distance. Could do the roof walk as natural.
Oliver – Her concern is the view from Cliff Road; the house looks huge.
Camp – She agrees with Ms. Oliver; the roofwalk will accentuate the height. Thinks a vegetative screen will be needed on both sides.
McLaughlin – Feels this house meets the requirements for the roofwalk. He wants to view this again.
Watterson – Agrees with Ms. Camp; this has a prominent presence on a hill; however, it isn't white and there wouldn't be much skirt on this roof. He'd like to view.
Coombs – Thinks a roof walk will make it too heavy.

Motion **Motion to View with a mock-up. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Watterson-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Camp-aye, Oliver-aye, Coombs-aye Certificate #

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approve Minutes	March 10 & April 21, 2020: Motion to Approve. (Coombs) Carried 5-0//Coombs-aye, Camp-aye, McLaughlin-aye, Oliver-aye, Pohl-aye
Review Minutes	April 27, 2020
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Next HDC Meeting Monday May 11, 2020 at 4:30pm: Flynn – We will meet on Tuesday May 19th and 26th; don't know the meeting schedule for June and if meetings will still be via ZOOM. Staff Update on New Checklists: https://www.nantucket-ma.gov/283/Historic-District-Commission Flynn – Described the checklists as posted on the website. Welch – There are minor things that we like to see and should be noted on the checklist. We could discuss that in a small ZOOM meeting. Oliver – Whoever is the staff taking in the applications must use the checklist as well. She and Mr. Welch will get with Ms. Flynn to work out the details. Discussion of Mission Statement for Town website and possible vote Pohl – Everyone has a copy of the draft mission statement. He has some minor comments. Welch – Reviewed the contents of the mission statement. Oliver – She thinks it's good. Watterson – Bullet points are effective except for the final two; they could stand alone from the first four, which are procedural. Welch – There are several ways to format it; explained why he did it this way. The first four address day-to-day operations. Backus – Feels it's important to add the fact that we have an active Historical Commission and link them to our webpage. Our public outreach coordinator could link the two boards. Welch – Asked to approve this subject to adding the two sentences. Motion to Approve with the addition of a reference to the Historical Commission. (Oliver) Carried 5-0//Oliver-aye, Camp-aye, Coombs-aye, Watterson-aye, Pohl-aye
Commission Comments	Backus – May is National Preservation Month; keep an eye out for stuff from Nantucket Preservation Trust

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Website application check lists
2. Draft HDC Mission Statement

Motion to Adjourn at 8:17 p.m. (Welch)
 Carried unanimously//Welch-aye, Oliver-aye, Camp-aye, Dutra-aye, Watterson-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board | Scosnet Advisory Board | Madaket Advisory Board